Gender Inequality and Land Rights: The Situation of Indigenous Women in Cameroon

EE Njieassam*



Abstract

Land is an essential resource that serves as a means of subsistence for millions of people in the world and indigenous communities and women in particular. Most indigenous societies' survival is closely tied to land. In Cameroon, indigenous women are the backbone of food production in their communities. That makes access to land important, as it is a significant source of wealth and power for indigenous peoples in general and indigenous women in particular. While women all over the world encounter gender-based discrimination in relation to the control and ownership of land, indigenous women face triple discrimination on the basis of their gender (as women), their ethnicity (as indigenous peoples) and their economic class (economically poor). They are often dehumanised, degraded and subjected to treatment as second-class human beings despite the existence of national legislation that discourages such practices. This paper interrogates the possibility of including indigenous women in government and decisionmaking processes in Cameroon in the hope that they may be involved in key decision-making processes that affect them, thereby reducing their economic and social vulnerability. It concludes with some thoughtful recommendations on policy reform aimed at ensuring access to land for indigenous women as well as socio-economic justice in its broadest sense.

Keywords

Indigenous women; gendered-based discrimination; land rights; gender inequality; decision-making; participation; Cameroon.

.....

P·E·K Pioneer in peer-reviewed, open access online law publications

Author

Ester E Njieassam

Affiliation

University of Johannesburg South Africa

Email

esthere@uj.ac.za

Date Submission

9 April 2018

Date Revised

26 September 2018

Date Accepted

28 January 2019

Date published

26 April 2019

Editor Prof M Carnelley

How to cite this article

Njieassam EE "Gender Inequality and Land Rights: The Situation of Indigenous Women in Cameroon" *PER / PELJ* 2019(22) - DOI http://dx.doi.org/10.17159/1727-3781/2019/v22i0a4907

Copyright



DOI http://dx.doi.org/10.17159/1727-3781/2019/v22i0a4907

1 Introduction

Land is an essential resource that serves as a means of subsistence for millions of people in the world and indigenous communities and women in particular. While most indigenous societies' survival is closely tied to land, their women are often the backbone of food production in their communities.¹ That makes access to land important, as it is a significant source of wealth and power for indigenous peoples in general and indigenous women in particular.² However, the recent trend of commercial and infrastructural development that is putting pressure on the traditional land of indigenous peoples is intensifying the denial of indigenous women's right to land.³ Wachira asserts that the massive loss of ancestral lands and natural resources is central to the pervasive discrimination and exclusion that indigenous peoples and their women encounter daily.⁴ Related studies reveal that customary practices have implanted patriarchal norms in Cameroonian society so that it is thought natural that men oppress, exploit and subordinate women, and prevent them from inheriting and controlling land.⁵ Sone is of the view that this practice has permitted men to make decisions and adopt laws that work in their favour to the detriment of women.⁶ Although indigenous women are actively involved in diverse roles in the family and community (such as child-bearing, caring for the children and the entire family, the construction of family huts, and food production), they do not have the right to own the land they use for food production.⁷ Therefore, the system of land tenure in Cameroon has predisposed men and women to participate in the public domain differently.⁸

There is a wealth of academic writing on women's right to land in Cameroon in general. However and unfortunately, the literature on indigenous women's right to land in Cameroon is scanty. This has suggested that there is a need for an investigation into the possible causes of this pervasive discrimination perpetrated against indigenous women about access to and

^{*} Esther E Njieassam. LLB (Buea) LLM LLD (NWU). Postdoctoral Research Fellow, South African Research Chair in International Law, Faculty of Law, University of Johannesburg, South Africa. E-mail: esthere@uj.ac.za.

¹ Same and Greenen Discourses, Fragmentation and Coalitions 1-14.

² Feiring 2013 http://www.landcoalition.org/sites/default/files/documents/resources/ InidgneousPeoplesRightsLandTerritoriesResources.pdf 45-46.

³ Anon 2017 http://pubs.iied.org/pdfs/17448IIED.pdf.

⁴ Wachira "Indigenous Peoples' Rights to Land and Natural Resources" 299.

⁵ Fonjong, Fombe and Sama-Lang 2013 *GeoJournal* 576.

⁶ Sone 2012 *J* Soc Dev Afr 87.

⁷ IFAD date unknown https://www.ifad.org/documents/10180/3629656a-70f3-4c94b58f-fd1e7ea2f4dc 1-10.

⁸ Fonjong, Fombe and Sama-Lang 2013 *GeoJournal* 576-577.

control of land. Given that indigenous peoples, especially women, are the most marginalised, disadvantaged and neglected group of people in Cameroonian society, a study of this nature becomes very important in my view.

This paper argues that the inclusion of indigenous women in government, and their participation in decision-making processes over issues that affect them, both directly and indirectly, may alleviate the crisis and ultimately change the way key issues such as access to and control over land are conducted in their communities. At the core of this paper is the argument that the inclusion of indigenous women in government (a liberal approach to public participation in the public affairs of the country as well as participation as citizens) is key to resolving the issue of access to and control over lands by indigenous women in Cameroon. In order to achieve this, this paper commences with a delineation of the indigenous peoples (and women in particular) in the Cameroonian context; as well as the different communities in which they live. This is followed by a discussion of the customary notion of land rights in the country. The paper examines the legislative framework that regulates access to land in Cameroon and the concept of gender inequality in the country is explored, especially with reference to its effects on indigenous women's right to land.

2 The origins of the indigenous peoples of Cameroon

The genesis of the indigenous peoples of Cameroon is as complex as the concept itself. Even though very limited or no literature exists in dealing with the origin of this group of people, several sources attest to the fact that they were the first inhabitants or "first peoples" to settle in the tropical forest of Cameroon before European colonisation.⁹ I will adopt the appellation "Pygmies" and "Mbororos" to refer to those groups who self-identify as indigenous peoples in Cameroon. Although there are some controversies, regarding the term "indigenous peoples" as it is considered insulting and derogatory, over time many indigenous peoples have preferred the name as it distinguishes them from the rest of the society.¹⁰

However, the mystery of how and where they originate from remains a debatable subject amongst academics. Verdu is of the opinion that the

⁹ CEDD, RACOPY and FPP 2010 http://www.forestpeoples. org/en/partners/ced/publication/2010/situation-indigenous-peoples-cameroonsupplementary-report-un-committe 9.

¹⁰ Survival International date unknown http://wwwsurvivalinternational org/tribes/pygmies.

"Pygmies" in Western Central Africa have existed for over 2,800 years and originated from an ancestral group 70,000 years ago that gave birth to the non-pygmy population.¹¹ History holds that the Bakas were the first inhabitants to settle at the borders of the southern and eastern regions of Cameroon.¹² They self-identify as "forest peoples" or "indigenous peoples" based on the spiritual attachment they have with the forests as well as the belief that they are the original inhabitants of the African tropical forests.¹³ The forest to them is a symbol of security and peace and must be preserved for future generations.¹⁴ As their primary occupations are hunting, fishing and gathering, their existence depends on the land, especially because the majority of them (women) have adopted a sedentary lifestyle with agriculture as their primary way of life.

On the other hand, the Mbororos in the North-West region of Cameroon (also known as the Fulani or Nomadic Fulani) originate from the Kano region, the present-day Nigeria, and from an ethnic group called Fulbe.¹⁵ They then migrated through the Sahel and Savannah belt from West to East Africa around the 19th century in search of fertile regions for cattle grazing and favourable political conditions.¹⁶ The favourable climatic conditions in Bamenda enabled their settlement.¹⁷ Other scholars believe that this group of people originated from the Berber community of North Africa and Sub-Sahara Africa between the 8th and 11th century AD.¹⁸ They then journeyed through the Middle East and later migrated to Senegal and eventually scattered throughout West and Central Africa and the borders of Ethiopia between 900-1900 AD.¹⁹ This group of people have always retained a

¹¹ Survival International date unknown http://wwwsurvivalinternational org/tribes/pygmies.

¹² ILO 2015 https://www.ilo.org/gender/Informationresources/Publications/WCMS_ 438854/lang--en/index.htmpdf.

¹³ Anadolu Agency 2017 https://www.dailysabah.com/feature/2017/08/03/insidecameroons-pygmy-community-traditions-lifestyle-and-religion; Mawoung 2001 *African Study Monographs* 209.

¹⁴ CEDD, RACOPY and FPP 2010 http://www.forestpeoples.org/ en/partners/ced/publication/2010/situation-indigenous-peoples-cameroonsupplementary-report-un-committe 9.

¹⁵ Anter 2011 https://www.modernghana.com/news/349849/1/who-are-the-fulanipeople-their-origins.html.

¹⁶ Pelican 2009 American Ethnologist 57.

¹⁷ It is important to note that although the Mbororos are scattered through all the provinces of Cameroon, most of them are settled in the North West Province of Cameroon, which is called Bamenda, and have adopted a sedimentary lifestyle; Pelican 2009 *American Ethnologist* 58.

¹⁸ Anter 2011 https://www.modernghana.com/news/349849/1/who-are-the-fulanipeople-their-origins.html.

¹⁹ Anter 2011 https://www.modernghana.com/news/349849/1/who-are-the-fulanipeople-their-origins.html.

nomadic lifestyle as herders and traders, which led to their developing several trade routes throughout West Africa.²⁰ Although recently most of them have also adopted a sedentary lifestyle, like the "Pygmies", they are still regarded as strangers and face significant challenges (especially the Mbororo women) regarding land ownership, and their exclusion from political spheres and decision-making processes.

The indigenous peoples have a unique lifestyle with a special connection to the environment, land and natural resources.²¹ The "Pygmy" and "Mbororo" women in Cameroon face similar problems of acute marginalisation, gender-based discrimination, segregation, rejection, poverty and denial of rights to land.²² Customary laws and the legal framework regulating land tenure and property rights threaten the integrity and security of indigenous women's access to and right to land.

2.1 The identification of the indigenous peoples of Cameroon

The identification of the indigenous peoples remains an ambiguous and challenging subject in Cameroon, especially in the absence of a universal definition of the concept. Most African states are reluctant to acknowledge the existence of indigenous peoples in their community and Cameroon is no exception.²³ International instruments specifically involved in promoting the rights of indigenous peoples such as the *ILO Convention No 169* and the *United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples* (UNDRIP)²⁴ do not adequately define the concept. This controversy was resolved (though this was not binding on states parties) when the African Commission on Human and Peoples Rights Working Group on Indigenous Populations/Communities outlined specific characteristics that describe and identify indigenous peoples in Africa.

It became clear in terms of the above that two groups in Cameroon meet the criteria and qualify as indigenous peoples: the Mbororo nomadic pastoralists and the hunter-gatherer communities known as the Forest Peoples or the "Pygmies".²⁵ Despite this, the *Constitution of Cameroon* failed to adequately protect the rights of indigenous peoples' and to

²⁰ Anter 2011 https://www.modernghana.com/news/349849/1/who-are-the-fulani-people-their-origins.html.

²¹ Abate and Kronk 2013 *Tul Envtl LJ* 180.

²² Coates Global History of Indigenous Peoples 138.

²³ Gilbert 2017 *ICL*Q 658.

²⁴ United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (2007) (UNDRIP).

²⁵ ILO 2015 https://www.ilo.org/gender/Informationresources/Publications/WCMS _438854/lang--en/index.htm.

specifically state which groups are classified as indigenous peoples.²⁶ Based on this, the government launched a study in 2009 aimed at investigating groups that qualify as indigenous peoples in Cameroon.²⁷ It is only recently that Cameroon has begun recognising the concept of indigeneity, after identifying certain groups as indigenous.²⁸ It is arguable that government acknowledges the existence of indigenous groups only when international organisations such as the World Bank intend funding indigenous programmes in an effort to improve their living conditions.²⁹ That notwithstanding, no group in Cameroon has been officially recognised as indigenous. Such people are often classified as "marginal populations" or "vulnerable groups".³⁰ It is therefore correct to say that the recurrent discrimination against indigenous women with regard to land tenure rights may be attributed to the lack of adequate recognition in the national Constitution. To this end, these groups continue to experience extreme levels of poverty, political repression and worse forms of economic and social inequality than non-indigenous women.

3 The customary notion of land rights in Cameroon

In Cameroon, as in most other African states, customary law constitutes a major source of law and is a vital part of the legal system. It has been given constitutional acknowledgement and protection, particularly with regard to customary land tenure and the various institutions governing it.³¹ Customary laws are defined as the laws, practices and customs of indigenous and local communities.³² They are usually unwritten social rules and structures of a community derived from their shared values based on tradition.³³ These rules serve as laws that are respected by and binding on every individual in the community. Some scholars contend that these norms were tricks of the

³⁰ Pelican 2013 Anthropol Today 13.

²⁶ See para 5(2) of the Constitution of the Republic of Cameroon, 1996.

²⁷ ILO 2015 https://www.ilo.org/gender/Informationresources/Publications/WCMS _438854/lang--en/index.htm. This study is still to be finalised. Progress has been made, and it is presently in its second stage.

See Bakang Mbock Speech; Nguh Implementing the Basic International Law Principles 8; ACHPR 2010 http://www.achpr.org/states/cameroon/reports/2nd-2003-2005/ 119-120; Ministry of Justice Cameroon Report on Human Rights 271; CEDD, RACOPY and FPP 2010 http://www.forestpeoples.org/en/partners/ced/ publication/2010/situation-indigenous-peoples-cameroon-supplementary-report-uncommitte 13.

²⁹ Pelican 2013 *Anthropol Today* 13-14.

³¹ Ossome 2014 *Feminist Economics* 155.

³² WIPO 2013 http://www.wipo.int/export/sites/www/tk/en/resources/pdf/ overview_customary_law.pdf.

³³ Fombad 2014 *JMAS* 481.

colonialists to ensure rapid social change and instability in the society.³⁴ For example, Chanock thinks that customary law is a colonial construct or tool embedded in law by both the white colonial masters and their black counterparts to establish a patriarchal order in the community, which prevents women from protecting their interests.³⁵ This societal construct has restricted women and indigenous women's (in particular) ability to inherit, own and control land, which is a vital resource for sustenance and sustainable development. Ndulo comments that traditionalists view customary law as an essential element to uphold traditional values and enhance human rights.³⁶ Thus, customary law is described as a living set of rules upon which most indigenous societies base their practices and activities.

Indigenous communities everywhere view land as a collective resource, although various controversies have emerged regarding the claim to this right, especially claims related to ownership and control.³⁷ By implication, no individual in the indigenous community could claim ownership of a piece of land, nor could the land be sold to non-indigenous people since the goal was to pass it on to posterity.³⁸ The entire community had a collective right to these lands and the resources therein.³⁹ Land and natural resources were considered ancestral gifts meant to be preserved and transmitted to the younger generations.⁴⁰ In practice, traditional societies at that time were governed by customary rules, that is, a customary land tenure system which governed the relationship between humans, the land and its resources.⁴¹ Land was therefore held under a communal land tenure system.⁴² The local chief or family heads, usually the men, hold land in custody for the entire community/family, with the power to "lease" out the land to individuals according to their demands (farming, hunting or building).⁴³ For instance, in Amodu Tijani v The Secretary, Southern Province Nigeria⁴⁴ the case

³⁴ Ossome 2014 *Feminist Economics* 157.

³⁵ Chanock *Law, Custom, and Social Order* 132.

³⁶ Ndulo 2011 *Ind J Global Legal Studies* 88.

³⁷ Jarboe 2010 *BC Third World LJ* 389-399.

³⁸ Amungwa 2011 *J Hum Ecol* 54-55.

³⁹ Nguiffo, Kenfack and Mballa "Influence of Historical and Contemporary Land Laws" 49-50.

⁴⁰ Wachira "Indigenous Peoples' Rights to Land and Natural Resources" 301-305; Lanz 2000 *Environment and History* 103-107.

⁴¹ Nguiffo, Kenfack and Mballa "The Influence of Historical and Contemporary Land Laws" 49.

⁴² Lanz 2000 *Environment and History* 103-104.

⁴³ Amungwa 2011 *J Hum Ecol* 54; Kameri Mbote date unknown http://erepository.uonbi.ac.ke/bitstream/handle/11295/41243/Fulltext?sequence=1.

⁴⁴ Amodu Tijani v The Secretary, Southern Province Nigeria 1992 2 AC 399.

concerned a dispute over compensation made in respect of land belonging to the Apapa community located in the then Colony of Nigeria. In accordance with the *Public Lands Ordinance* of 1903, the Governor had the right to possess for public purposes any land considered not in use, and to compensate the community through the Head Chief. The Head Chief held the land in trust for the community. In this case, the Head Chief challenged the compensation paid and demanded the full value of the land. The Supreme Court held that the appellant should be compensated in accordance with the *Public Lands Ordinance* 5 of 1903 on the grounds that he had provided full ownership and title to the land in question. The Court also held that the appellant should transfer the land to the Governor in full ownership, with the exception that the land was unoccupied, together with his title to collect rents or tribute, and that the compensation awarded be distributed amongst the community members in accordance with the Native Council District in agreement with the Governor.

Women generally do not experience challenges in accessing land for food production: the issue arises when it comes to complete control and ownership of land.⁴⁵ Men dominate the decision-making process under customary law, especially as most of the land under the customary land tenure system is unregistered.⁴⁶ As a result, they tend to make decisions regarding the security of tenure that discriminates against women.⁴⁷ The responsibility for these discriminatory practices can be attributed to the functioning of the indigenous communities as patriarchies, which makes it difficult for women to be on a par with men, especially with regard to the control and ownership of land.⁴⁸

Since land is a symbol of indigenous peoples' survival and culture, access to and control over land is crucial for their everyday existence.⁴⁹ Indigenous communities in Cameroon are governed by customary laws that are reluctant to incorporate land titling and ownership for women. The general perception is that women are weak and incompetent, and would be unable to manage and control lands even if they were granted ownership rights.⁵⁰ Related studies reveal that women often change their status at marriage and can transfer the family's heritage to the man they love or marry.⁵¹ Thus

⁴⁵ Sone 2012 *J Soc Dev Afr* 86.

⁴⁶ Sone 2012 *J Soc Dev Afr* 86-87.

⁴⁷ Sone 2012 *J Soc Dev Afr* 87-88.

⁴⁸ World Rainforest Women 2016 http://wrm.org.uy/articles-from-the-wrmbulletin/section1/women-and-property-in-cameroon-laws-and-reality/.

⁴⁹ Anaya 2005 *Ariz J Int'l & Comp L* 7, 8.

⁵⁰ Asiimwe and Crankshaw 2011 *JLCR* 8-9.

⁵¹ Sone 2012 *J Soc Dev Afr* 85.

they do not deserve legal entitlement to land.⁵² To this effect, women can only have possession of land upon marriage or through what Sone and Fonjong, Sama-Lang and Fombe call *matrikins* and *patrikins*, which ultimately comes to an end when the marriage is terminated (usually upon divorce or the death of her husband).⁵³ Even though the village representatives effectively manage this pattern of customary norms without conflicts, it subjects women to men's authority.⁵⁴ In fact, customary law does not recognise women's right to land. Instead, traditional practices cause women to adopt an attitude of self-exclusion from tenure matters and to viewed land as a men's thing.⁵⁵ This practice has greatly discouraged indigenous women in particular from investing in land, even though they are considered the major drivers in ensuring sustainable development, food security and poverty alleviation in their communities.⁵⁶ It is against this backdrop that indigenous women are treated as mere peasants with no right to the ownership of land in their communities.

During the pre-colonial era indigenous women did not have rights to land, like their male counterparts. However, this generally did not have major implications for the women, as there was a vast amount of land that was communally owned.⁵⁷ The situation was exacerbated by colonialism. At this point, it is significant to provide a brief historical background of the colonial period relating to access and the right to land for indigenous peoples and women in particular.

Cameroon has the dubious distinction of being the only African state that underwent the tutelage of three European powers at different times.⁵⁸ It is beyond dispute that each European power, during its time in Cameroon shaped the political, legal and socio-economic development of the country to some extent, which negatively affected indigenous communities (in the areas under their administration). The German colonial rule lasted from 1884-1916.⁵⁹ During the period of the German annexation, *Kamerun* (as the Germans commonly referred to it) became a German colony.⁶⁰ Upon the

⁵² Sone 2012 *J Soc Dev Afr* 85.

⁵³ Sone Concept of Equality and Access to Land in Cameroon 81; Fonjong, Sama-Lang and Fombe 2010 *PGDT* 157.

⁵⁴ Sone 2012 J Soc Dev Afr 85-89.

⁵⁵ World Rainforest Women 2016 http://wrm.org.uy/articles-from-the-wrmbulletin/section1/women-and-property-in-cameroon-laws-and-reality/.

⁵⁶ Fonjong 2016 *Africa Development* 55.

⁵⁷ Fonjong, Sama-Lang and Fombe 2010 *PGDT* 157.

⁵⁸ Njoh 2013 *IJURR* 750.

⁵⁹ Cameroon was later on placed under the mandate of the League of Nations and partitioned between France and Britain.

⁶⁰ Lekane and Asuelime 2016 *J Contemp Hist* 135.

discovery of some fertile areas for coffee production, the German colonial masters enacted the *Crown Land Act* of 1896.⁶¹ The aim was to deprive the local chiefs of their positions as custodians of traditional lands by imposing the doctrine of "alien rule".⁶² This permitted the German colonialist to own and control all unexploited land and transform the country into a German overseas territory.⁶³ The *"herron loss"* land policy instituted by the Germans considered all unoccupied land as lands without owners and assumed these lands as theirs.⁶⁴ This policy resulted in the gross disruption of indigenous communities. They were deprived of their ancestral lands, while indigenous administrations managed by local chiefs were destroyed.⁶⁵ The outcome of this was that the Germans acquired huge tracts of land, which indigenous peoples had preserved for their traditional rites and burial sites, and the customary notion of land tenure was outlawed, aggravating the situation of indigenous women having no right to access, own and control of land.⁶⁶

The issue of land ownership was not different under the British⁶⁷ and French⁶⁸ administration. After the defeat of the Germans, the country was partitioned into two areas. The English-speaking part (British Northern Cameroons and British Southern Cameroons) was placed under the colonial auspices of Britain.⁶⁹ France assumed Trusteeship over the larger part of the territory as French Cameroun. The British administration adopted a system of indirect rule by importing the *Land and Native Rights Ordinance* of Northern Nigeria into Southern Cameroons in 1927.⁷⁰ In addition, the major Land Tenure Law (Ordinance 1 of 1927) assigned control of all native land to the British Governor. To this end, all native lands with the exception of estates registered and recognised by the British Governor were native lands, of which he was the sole custodian.⁷¹ Thus, indigenous peoples were

Nguiffo, Kenfack and Mballa "Influence of Historical and Contemporary Land Laws"
3.

⁶² Geschiere 1993 *Africa* 151-152; Lang and Astadji 2018 *GJAHSS* 2.

 ⁶³ Nguiffo, Kenfack and Mballa "Influence of Historical and Contemporary Land Laws"
3.

⁶⁴ Sone 2012 *J Soc Dev Afr* 85-86.

⁶⁵ Lekane and Asuelime 2016 *J Contemp Hist* 136.

⁶⁶ Sone 2012 J Soc Dev Afr 85-86; Lekane and Asuelime 2016 J Contemp Hist 136.

⁶⁷ The southern regions of Cameroon were administered by the British from 1914-1961 as an integral part of British Nigeria.

⁶⁸ The French, on the other hand, administered the French-speaking regions from 1916 to 1960, when the country finally gained its independence.

⁶⁹ Njoh et al 2017 Women's Stud Int Forum 2.

⁷⁰ Nfah-Abbenyi 2016 *Tydskrif vir Letterkunde* 6-7.

⁷¹ Fonjong, Sama-Lang and Fon 2010 *PDGT* 159.

not only stripped off their customary rights but also became mere occupiers of their land at the mercy of the Governor.⁷²

The French administration in Cameroon was like the British. The urge to accumulate huge tracts of land was a priority for their administrators. The aim was to transfer what they referred to as uninhabited land - a legal fiction known as "*terra nullius*" or "*terres vacantes et sans maître*" to the management and control of the French colonial authorities.⁷³ Although this was met with some resistance, little success was recorded on the part of the local indigenes. Indigenous peoples were given usage rights only to cultivate food crops. In essence, the shadows of these practices still haunt the post-colonial indigenous women in today's Cameroon.

The word *évolués* was used to classify indigenous peoples who had accepted and adopted the European way of life.⁷⁴ Using Fonjong, Sama-Lang and Fombe's words, "colonisation has tilted the gender balance in favour of the males",⁷⁵ most especially as the post-colonial government, inherited colonial policies and land grabbing has become the order of the day. This is why indigenous women are still grappling with the issue of the control and ownership of land. Customary practices have caused them to remain under the dependence of men. This practice incites petty conflicts in family circles.

4 The legislative framework regulating land rights in Cameroon

It may be observed that Cameroon's land tenure system is characterised by what scholars like Ossome term "good" modern law and "bad" tradition.⁷⁶ This is a reference to the enactment of land reforms and the application of existing customary laws that regulate land issues in the country. In other words, the land ownership system is anchored in a purely patriarchal setting in Cameroon. The debate concerning women's land rights has for decades remained an unresolved and contentious issue in many academic debates, despite the country's commitment to guaranteeing property rights and ensuring gender equality for everyone, including indigenous women.

⁷² Section 2 of the Land and Native Rights Ordinance 1 of 1927.

 ⁷³ Nguiffo, Kenfack and Mballa "Influence of Historical and Contemporary Land Laws"
3.

⁷⁴ Lekane and Asuelime 2016 *J Contemp Hist* 140.

⁷⁵ Fonjong, Sama-Lang and Fombe 2012 *Ethics and Social Welfare* 261.

⁷⁶ Ossome 2014 *Feminist Economics* 155.

The 1996 *Constitution* and the 1974 *Land Ordinance* in Cameroon are not gender-biased. Both laws enhance the right to property for citizens. For example, the Preamble to the 1996 *Constitution* stipulates that "the human person, without distinction as to race, religion, sex or belief, possesses inalienable and sacred rights."⁷⁷ A simple and clear interpretation of this provision means that the Constitution prohibits any and every form of discrimination based on gender deterring people from enjoying their rights. As a matter of emphasis, the Constitution further provides that

[o]wnership shall mean the right guaranteed to every person by law to use, enjoy and dispose of property. No person shall be deprived thereof, save for public purposes and subject to the payment of compensation under conditions determined by law.⁷⁸

A thorough reading of this provision implies that all people in the country (indigenous women inclusive) have exclusive rights not only to access and use but also to exercise absolute right of ownership over property, including land. Interestingly, the *Constitution* has expressly stated that "the State shall ensure the protection of minorities and shall preserve the rights of indigenous populations in accordance with the law."⁷⁹ By implication, there is no legal justification as to why indigenous women should be denied the right to own and control land based on customary beliefs.⁸⁰ Since land symbolises economic and political power, granting indigenous women the right of ownership would help empower and enable them be active drivers in all development processes and would encourage them to improve their productivity.⁸¹ A more effective measure will be allowing indigenous women to participate in government and be part of the decision-making process, especially on matters regarding land reform.

In addition, Cameroon has affirmed its attachment to ensuring equality in rights by invoking the fundamental principles enshrined in the *Universal Declaration of Human Rights*,⁸² the *Charter of the United Nations* and the *African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights*,⁸³ including all duly ratified

⁷⁷ See para 4 of the Preamble to the *Constitution of the Republic of Cameroon*, 1996 to amend the *Constitution* of 2 June 1972 as amended in 2008.

⁷⁸ See para 5(19) of the Preamble to the *Constitution of the Republic of Cameroon*, 1996 to amend the *Constitution* of 2 June 1972 as amended in 2008.

⁷⁹ Para 5(2) of the Preamble to the *Constitution of the Republic of Cameroon*, 1996 to amend the *Constitution* of 2 June 1972 as amended in 2008.

⁸⁰ Fonjong, Sama-Lang and Fombe 2012 *Ethics and Social Welfare* 263.

⁸¹ Fombe *et al* 2013 *Ethics and Economics* 76.

⁸² Universal Declaration on Human Rights (1948) (UDHR) 71.

⁸³ African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights (1981) (Banjul Charter).

international conventions related to these instruments.⁸⁴ In principle, international law is law and self-executing in Cameroon. For instance, Article 45 of the 1996 *Constitution* states that

... duly approved or ratified treaties and international agreements shall, following their publication, override national laws, provided the other party implements the said treaty or agreement.⁸⁵

Based on the content of this constitutional provision, the application of any international instrument in Cameroon is automatic.⁸⁶

Article 17 of the UDHR guarantees everyone's right to property and call on states to refrain from practices and policies that deprive anyone, indigenous peoples and women included, from enjoying this right. In a similar vein, Articles 18(3), 19 and 21 of the African Charter on Human and Peoples *Rights* emphasise the need to refrain from all forms of discrimination against anyone and the right to freely dispose of one's property. Articles 2(f)(g), 5(a) and 16(h) of the Convention for the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women⁸⁷ crowns it all by calling on states to eradicate customs and practices that violate women's rights. It also imposes an obligation on state parties to adopt effective and appropriate measures to ensure that all women exercise the right of ownership, acquisition, administration and disposition of property indiscriminately. Even though the above provisions do not specifically refer to indigenous women, the wording "everyone" or "all people" can be interpreted to include indigenous women. It has been argued that these provisions serve as a vital step towards securing the right to land of indigenous women.⁸⁸ Related studies reveal that building on CEDAW, indigenous women anticipate finding a connection between international human rights instruments promoting their rights, and local values and practices that improve their rights, most especially their rights to land.⁸⁹

Moreover, the rights of indigenous women to property are also echoed in the *International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights*;⁹⁰ the *International*

⁸⁴ See para 5 of the *Constitution of the Republic of Cameroon*, 1996 to amend the *Constitution* of 2 June 1972 as amended in 2008.

⁸⁵ Article 45 of the *Constitution of the Republic of Cameroon*, 1996 to amend the *Constitution* of 2 June 1972 as amended in 2008.

⁸⁶ Njieassam Analysis of Legislative and Institutional Frameworks 106.

⁸⁷ Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women (1979) (CEDAW).

⁸⁸ UN 2010 http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/unpfii/documents/BriefingNote6_GREY.pdf.

⁸⁹ UN 2010 http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/unpfii/documents/BriefingNote6_GREY.pdf.

⁹⁰ Articles 1, 2, 3, 26 and 27 of the *International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights* (1966) (ICCPR).

Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights;⁹¹ and the UNDRIP. These international instruments specifically deal with the protection of the rights of indigenous peoples.⁹² All of the above international instruments have provisions that enhance indigenous women's property rights, bearing in mind gender issues and the principle of non-discrimination. Article 2 of the UNDRIP stipulates that:

[i]indigenous peoples and individuals are free and equal to other peoples and individuals and have the right to be free from any kind of discrimination, in the exercise of their rights, in particular that based on their indigenous origin and identity.

Although the UNDRIP has a non-binding status, all three international instruments impose an obligation on state parties to enact legislative and other measures that would help promote indigenous women's rights to land ownership and control.

Additionally, as mentioned earlier, the 1974 *Land Ordinance* is gender neutral. The laws encourage private property rights but recommend that these lands be titled and registered.⁹³ The provision that insists on land registration as proof of land ownership poses significant challenges to indigenous peoples and women, who do not have any legal documentation to show proof of their entitlement to land. In essence, the customary practices in these settings are what Mafa *et al* call "gender blind",⁹⁴ although Ndi and Batterbury argue that they are a trick to exert persistent male dominance over women.⁹⁵ Allanana feels that they are a strategic way of exerting political and economic power over women to ensure that they remain subordinate in relation to property rights.⁹⁶

From this analysis, it is clear that despite constitutional promises of equality in property rights, indigenous women's interests, in particular, are not considered, despite their significant contribution to the social well-being of their families and communities. It is acknowledged that indigenous women's rights to land ownership are violated and insecure under the overlapping provision of section 16 of the 1974 *Land Ordinance* and customary law.⁹⁷ It is observed that existing land tenure systems, whether customary systems

⁹¹ Articles 1 and 5 of the International Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural *Rights* (1966) (ICESCR).

⁹² See Arts 1, 2, 17(3), 18, 22 and 25 of the UNDRIP.

⁹³ Pemunta 2017 *AJESD* 70.

⁹⁴ Mafa *et al* "Gender and Land Politics in Zimbabwe" 109-110.

⁹⁵ Ndi and Batterbury 2017 *Africa Spectrum* 37.

⁹⁶ Allanana 2013 *ESJ* 117.

⁹⁷ Polavarapu 2013 *Ga J Int'l & Comp L* 93-131.

of regulation (in law or administration) or statutory formal systems, are rooted in unequal and discriminatory power structures and procedures.⁹⁸ This pattern usually has great repercussions for local food security, given the high level of (indigenous women's) dependence on land for production in their communities.⁹⁹ To indigenous women land is a symbol of spiritual, social and cultural identity, economic welfare, well-being and values. If their rights to land were given priority, this would guarantee their active role in government and in decision-making processes.¹⁰⁰

5 Gender inequality and its effects on indigenous women's right to land in Cameroon

The question of gender inequality is of serious concern in most African societies, including Cameroon, especially as women's activities are severally narrowed in an informal and non-wage economy.¹⁰¹ Given that their activities are basically aimed at survival, the women involved in this domain do not have access to land.¹⁰² The basis for this argument is rooted in the way society has constructed different roles for women and girls, and men and boys. The inbuilt societal structures of domination seek to ensure that women remain permanently subordinated to men, as wives, daughters, sisters or widows.¹⁰³ This renders women helpless, with little or no option to make decisions regarding their socio-economic development.

Social norms relating to gender represent society's most profound grasp of what it entails to be a "real" woman and a "real" man.¹⁰⁴ The practices that arise from these assumptions are exacerbated in indigenous communities. The situation for indigenous women is particularly dire, as they experience especial discrimination due to their age-old history of marginalisation/suppression, including traditional discriminatory practices.¹⁰⁵ Studies indicate that the triple discrimination faced by indigenous women stems from their ethnicity, gender and class.¹⁰⁶ Building on the above, the principle of the indivisibility of rights negates their potential to fully exercise their human rights, especially those related to land

⁹⁸ Sone 2012 *J Soc Dev Afr* 87.

⁹⁹ Vermeulen and Cotula 2010 *J Peasant Stud* 905.

¹⁰⁰ Verma 2014 *Feminist Economics* 52-60

¹⁰¹ Verma 2014 *Feminist Economics* 52-60.

¹⁰² Anunobi 2002 *ASSR* 12.

¹⁰³ Fonjong, Sama-Lang and Fombe 2012 *Ethics and Social Welfare* 261.

¹⁰⁴ Petesch 2012 *Ethics and Social Welfare* 234.

¹⁰⁵ Badger 2011 *Am U Int'l L Rev* 489.

¹⁰⁶ Sieder and Sierra Indigenous Women's Access to Justice 36.

ownership, when the collective rights of their people are violated.¹⁰⁷ In effect, indigenous women's ability to exercise their fundamental socioeconomic, cultural and political rights including their right to access and control land as articulated in international instruments is intricately linked to the right to self-determination in their territories.¹⁰⁸ To this end, their inability to participate in public life and decision-making processes constrains them from accessing their land rights in Cameroon. This renders the possibility of achieving gender equality in Cameroon a pipedream.

The literature on women and land in sub-Saharan Africa dismisses prospects of women owning and controlling land through lineage or inheritance.¹⁰⁹ It is estimated that over 90% of the population and particularly 80-85% of the women depend on land for their livelihood, as it is the only resource that provides direct benefits for peasants in urban and rural areas.¹¹⁰ Land is thus a vital asset in enhancing the country's gross domestic product and improving living conditions for local and indigenous communities.¹¹¹ The significance of land to human existence implies that the refusal to grant indigenous women land rights undermines efforts to promote gender equality in a predominantly patriarchal society, as is Cameroon. This exclusion prevents them from enjoying their socioeconomic and political rights essential to attaining full membership of society and partaking in decisions regarding property rights as well as executing other duties in the community.¹¹² It is submitted that the negation of indigenous women's right to land is an act of violence perpetrated against them, limits their ability to participate in the political sphere, and is an obstacle to making their voices heard at the domestic, local and national levels. Ndahinda expresses the opinion that the above practice impedes any progress towards the protection of indigenous peoples' rights in general.113

Foreign investors who acquire land for the extraction of natural resources, which the government terms economic development, exacerbate the situation regarding land rights in Cameroon.¹¹⁴ Moreda thinks that the

41243/Fulltext?sequence=1.

¹⁰⁷ UN 2010 http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/unpfii/documents/BriefingNote6_GREY.pdf.

¹⁰⁸ UN 2010 http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/unpfii/documents/BriefingNote6_GREY.pdf.

¹⁰⁹ Fombe *et al* 2013 *Ethics and Economics* 75.

¹¹⁰ Fombe *et al* 2013 *Ethics and Economics* 74; Abbia *et al* 2016 *IJRAFS* 4-6.

¹¹¹ Kameri-Mbote date unknown http://erepository.uonbi.ac.ke/bitstream/handle/11295/ 41243/Fulltext?sequence=1.

¹¹² Kameri-Mbote date unknown http://erepository.uonbi.ac.ke/bitstream/handle/ 11295/

¹¹³ See generally Ndahinda *Indigenousness in Africa*.

¹¹⁴ Fombe *et al* 2013 *Ethics and Economics* 74-75.

growing interest in land resources has instigated competition amongst different sectors over the same resource, depriving indigenous women of the abiity to access their traditional source of survival.¹¹⁵ Whitehead and Tsikata share the same view, stating that this has resulted in a historical shift from Cameroon's being a land of abundance to an acute scarcity of land, an alteration that has created stark gender inequality among the indigenous comunities in Cameroon.¹¹⁶ Thus, the creation in 2014 of the Ngoyla-Mintom nature reserve in a forest used by Baka women for food production resulted in their eviction and prevention from entering and accessing the area they used for food cultivation,¹¹⁷ this preventing them from continuing with their traditional and income-generating activities. This has contributed to food insecurity, further rural poverty, hunger and unemployment. Their inability to access the resource from which they would reap direct revenues to sustain their households has alienated them from their identity and society. According to Barume, failure by the post-colonial government to consider indigenous peoples' occupation of the land poses an obstacle for indigenous women's right to land in Cameroon.¹¹⁸

6 The challenges to indigenous women's ability to own and control land

Land is the basis of indigenous cultures, economies, spiritual practices and political systems, as well as a primary source of food production for indigenous women. It is also a traditional stronghold within which all family and developmental issues regarding the community originate.¹¹⁹ Therefore, land is a vital assert for indigenous women's cultural development and wellbeing. Unfortunately, there has been insecurity of land tenure for indigenous women in Cameroon, as access to, control over and ownership of this resource remain a male privilege. These embedded societal structures have negatively affected indigenous women's ability to contribute to the development of their community. The following section of this article examines the challenges encountered by indigenous women in accessing and controlling land.

¹¹⁵ Moreda 2017 *Third World* Q 698, 699.

¹¹⁶ Whitehead and Tsikata 2003 *J Agrar Change* 67, 68.

¹¹⁷ UN 2018 https://www.culturalsurvival.org/sites/default/files/UPR-report-Cameroon-2017.pdf 5.

¹¹⁸ Barume Land Rights of Indigenous Peoples 38.

¹¹⁹ Ngwa "Introduction to Land and Rural Women in Cameroon" 3-8.

6.1 Lack of proper recognition

The greatest challenge indigenous peoples' face worldwide is the lack of teir adequate recognition by national governments. This is compounded by the lack of a universally accepted definition and a refusal by African states to acknowledge the existence of this group of people on their continent.¹²⁰ Most African governments maintain that the term is linked with a "premodern lifestyle".¹²¹ Based on this argument, it is obvious that the government of Cameroon has not taken a keen interest in providing constitutional recognition to its indigenous population, even though mention is made of it in the Preamble to the Constitution. Pelican argues that the absence of clarity as to the nature of the right and which group represents indigenous peoples in Cameroon is a major hindrance to granting them the special recognition and protection they deserve.¹²² No specific legislation in the country addresses indigenous peoples' issues. The lack of proper recognition has seriously limited indigenous women's ability to own and control land, even though their entire existence depends on it. Recent studies have identified two major challenges to indigenous peoples' constitutional recognition in their various states. Firstly, there is the fact that their societies have been completely "forgotten", and secondly is the fact that their core issues are kept in a "vacuum".¹²³

It can be argued that involving indigenous women in politics would enable them to challenge decisions that are detrimental to their well-being, including their right to own and control land. Considering that land is a socioeconomic resource, granting indigenous women access to and control over land would empower them and enhance their level of economic productivity. As Rwegasira posits, land is a human right that encompasses all facets of life at all levels of human society.¹²⁴ The significance of land to human survival and livelihoods is that those who own and control land indirectly control the lives of others.¹²⁵ Indigenous women, in particular, are constantly in a state of dependence on men. It is essential that land reforms be redirected to address indigenous women's needs, such as to elevate their status, improve their skills and empower them to live independently. As Njoh

¹²⁰ Pelican and Maruyama 2015 *Afr Stud Monogr* 49.

¹²¹ Viljoen "Reflections on the Legal Protection of Indigenous People's Rights in Africa" 75, 82.

¹²² Pelican 2013 *Anthropol Today* 13-14.

¹²³ African Development Bank Group 2016 https://www.afdb.org/fileadmin/uploads/afdb/Documents/Publications/Development _and_Indigenous_Peoples_in_Africa__En_-_v3_.pdf.

¹²⁴ Rwegasira Land as a Human Right xviii.

¹²⁵ Rwegasira Land as Human Right xviii.

and Ananga have stated, enhancing women's economic proficiency might eliminate gender-based discrimination and improve their development outcomes.¹²⁶ In effect, indigenous women would be actively represented in government and take part in decision-making processes, especially those that might have a negative impact on their livelihoods. Their inability to own land renders them under-developed and relegates them to a destitute position. As some scholars rightly suggest that women's access to and right to land will greatly improve their economic power, as they could use land as security to secure loans that would help them to improve their lifestyle, and develop them and their communities.¹²⁷

6.2 Poverty

It is a shared premise that indigenous peoples globally suffer from pervasive forms of injustices and have remained the subjects of pervasive discrimination, inequality and genocide.¹²⁸ Studies reveal that these discriminatory practices account for the fact that indigenous peoples live below the poverty line and are described as the poorest of the poor in the societies where they reside.¹²⁹ In Cameroon, the Pygmies and Mbororo pastoralist communities are amongst the poorest of the poor, especially as their right to land and natural resources is often violated.¹³⁰

If indigenous peoples in general are struggling to gain access to and control over traditionally owned lands, one can only imagine the situation of indigenous women. Graham and Wiessner see this as the reason why indigenous peoples and most especially women frequently experience a wide range of serious human rights violations such as inequality, political marginalisation, social exclusion and poverty.¹³¹ The unpalatable consequences of these practice is the impoverishment suffered by indigenous women, particularly with the existence of the double system of statutory law and indigenous customary law, which permits men to constantly manipulate the system to their advantage.¹³² The general presumption is that indigenous women lack the capacity to manage their

¹²⁶ Njoh and Ananga 2016 Soc Indic Res 91.

¹²⁷ Sone 2012 J Soc Dev Afr, Fonjong, Sama-Lang and Fombe 2012 Ethics and Social Welfare 261.

¹²⁸ Money 2006/2007 *Am Indian L Rev* 553.

¹²⁹ Swing, Davidov and Schwartz 2012 J Dev Soc 257.

¹³⁰ UN Human Rights Council Report of the Independent Expert on minority issues, Addendum: Mission to Cameroon (2-11 September 2013) UN Doc A/HRC/25/56/Add.1 (2014).

¹³¹ Graham and Wiessner 2011 SAQ 403.

¹³² Kameri-Mbote "I Want It and I Want It Now" 5-6.

own affairs even if they are granted access to and control over land. Their husbands, brothers or male family representatives will eventually manage the land. This perception has placed indigenous women in a peripheral position of acute poverty, as they have to depend solely on men for everything.

Additionally, the increasing need for resources to meet economic growth has increased the pressure on indigenous peoples' lands to the extent that indigenous women are running out of options for food security in the community.¹³³ The persistent acquisition of vast amounts of land by foreign firms renders indigenous women helpless, causing a sharp decline in their living standards and trapping them in poverty with no access to the only means of their subsistence like food, fuel-wood and water.¹³⁴ Ossome contends that a lack of critical information about their civic and political rights renders them even more vulnerable to manipulation and dispossession, especially as land deals are often justified on the basis of peoples' immediate needs.¹³⁵ Land that is used for food production is usually viewed in the patriarchal Cameroonian society as not being properly developed. Thus, there is always a tendency to lose these lands to developmental projects initiated by government and other extractive companies. It is observed that the loss of ancestral lands is key to the systemic marginalisation and poor conditions indigenous women encounter every day.136

6.3 Marginalisation

Marginalisation is a common phrase used to describe the position of indigenous peoples. They are always victims of several human rights violations including social, economic, cultural and political marginalisation. Indigenous women in Cameroon who experience double discrimination in all spheres of life feel this marginalisation more. Their vulnerable status exposes them to gross human rights violations such as rape, prostitution, lack of inheritance rights, which is attributed to their high level of illiteracy, ignorance of their civic and political rights, and extreme poverty. This status, coupled with the way society perceives them, hinders them from owing and controlling land. For instance, Mbororo women are strictly viewed as objects, only good enough to be child bearers, housekeepers and providers of food for the family. They are not entitled to own land or to be consulted

¹³³ Fonjong 2016 *Africa Development* 50-54.

¹³⁴ Fonjong 2016 *Africa Development* 50.

¹³⁵ Ossome 2014 *Feminist Economics* 164.

¹³⁶ Wachira "Indigenous Peoples' Rights to Land and Natural Resources" 299.

on issues relating to land.¹³⁷ The society is strictly male-dominated in such a way that women do not have a say in any decisions concerning them and the family. Their defined gender roles, early and forced marriages and frequent childbirths, where boys are favoured over girls, result in their lower participation rates in school and higher drop-out rates than boys.¹³⁸

7 Conclusion

In Cameroon indigenous women are often more marginalised than nonindigenous women. Although there are no reliable statistical data to back up this argument, it is observed that indigenous women record high incidences of rape, maternal and mortality rates, gender-based violence, preventable and communicable diseases, and illiteracy, and have limited rights to inheritance and property.¹³⁹ Anunobi believes that despite women's significant role in development and food production, their status in most African societies does not reflect the sacrifices they make.¹⁴⁰ For indigenous women, whose livelihoods and survival are tied to land, and who make invaluable contributions to their society in terms of food security and alleviating poverty, little effort has been made to address the situation. Customary norms perpetrating gender inequality have aggravated the situation of indigenous women in Cameroon. It is therefore essential for government policies to be responsive to the needs of indigenous women and to ensure their active engagement in decision-making processes, especially those relating to land rights. There is also a need to revisit land legislation in Cameroon to ensure that the provisions do not prevent women from accessing and controlling land. Most importantly, an inclusive system of government where indigenous women are active participants is highly recommended in Cameroon.

¹³⁷ Unstructured interview with a few Mbororo students attending the University of Yaoundé II during a field trip on the 10 of February 2016 in Yaoundé, Cameroon.

See data collected in 2011 by the Cameroon Indigenous Women's Forum. The rate of illiteracy among Mbororo Fulani pastoralist women is around 98%; Bouba 2012 http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/IPeoples/IFP/Aeisatu_Bouba_December_ 2012.pdf.

¹³⁹ UN 2010 http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/unpfii/documents/BriefingNote6_GREY.pdf.

¹⁴⁰ Anunobi 2002 ASSR 1.

Bibliography

Literature

Abate and Kronk 2013 Tul Envtl LJ

Abate SR and Kronk EA "Commonality among Unique Indigenous Communities: An Introduction to Climate Change and its Impact on Indigenous Peoples" 2013 *Tul Envtl LJ* 179-195

Abbia et al 2016 IJRAFS

Abbia WA *et al* "Agriculture in Cameroon: Proposed Strategies to Sustain Productivity" 2016 *IJRAFS* 1-12

Allanana 2013 ESJ Allanana MG "Patriarchy and Gender Inequality in Nigeria: The Way Forward" 2013 ESJ 115-144

Amungwa 2011 J Hum Ecol

Amungwa FA "The Evolution of Conflicts Related to Natural Resource Management in Cameroon" 2011 *J Hum Ecol* 53-60

Anaya 2005 Ariz J Int'l & Comp L

Anaya J "Indigenous Peoples' Participatory Rights in relation to Decisions about Natural Resources Extraction: The More Fundamental Issue of what Rights Indigenous Peoples have in Lands and Resources" 2005 *Ariz J Int'l* & *Comp L* 7-17

Anunobi 2002 ASSR

Anunobi FO "Women and Development in Africa: From Marginalization to Gender Inequality" 2002 ASSR 1-24

Asiimwe and Crankshaw 2011 JLCR

Asiimwe FA and Crankshaw O "The Impact of Customary Laws on Inheritance: A Case Study of Widows in Urban Uganda" 2011 *JLCR* 7-13

Badger 2011 Am U Int'l L Rev

Badger A "Collective v Individual Human Rights in Membership Governance for Indigenous Peoples" 2011 *Am U Int'l L Rev* 485-514

Bakang Mbock Speech

Bakang Mbock C Speech by the Ministry of Social Affairs at the Ceremony Marking the Celebration of the Second Edition of the International Day of Indigenous Peoples, Referred to in Cameroon as Marginal Populations (9 August 2009)

Barume Land Rights of Indigenous Peoples Barume AK Land Rights of Indigenous Peoples in Africa: With Special Focus on Central, Eastern and Southern Africa 2nd ed (Eks-Skolens Trykkeri Copenhagen 2014)

Chanock Law, Custom, and Social Order

Chanock M Law, Custom, and Social Order: The Colonial Experience in Malawi and Zambia (Heinemann Portsmouth 1998)

Coates Global History of Indigenous Peoples Coates K A Global History of Indigenous Peoples: Struggle and Survival (MTM Johannesburg 2015)

Fombad 2014 JMAS

Fombad CM "Gender Equality in African Customary Law: Has the Male Ultimogeniture Rule any Future in Botswana?" 2014 *JMAS* 475-494

Fombe et al 2013 Ethics and Economics

Fombe LF *et al* "Securing Tenure for Sustainable Livelihoods: A Case of Women Land Ownership in Anglophone Cameroon" 2013 *Ethics and Economics* 73-86

Fonjong 2016 Africa Development

Fonjong L "Women's Land Rights and Working Conditions in Large-scale Plantations in Sub-Saharan Africa" 2016 *Africa Development* 49-69

Fonjong, Sama-Lang and Fombe 2010 PGDT

Fonjong F, Sama-Lang IF and Fombe LF "Assessment of the Evolution of Land Tenure System in Cameroon and Its Effects on Women's Land Rights and Food Security" 2010 *PGDT* 154-169

Fonjong, Sama-Lang and Fombe 2012 *Ethics and Social Welfare* Fonjong F, Sama-Lang IF and Fombe LF "Implications of Customary Practices on Gender Discrimination in Land Ownership in Cameroon" 2012 *Ethics and Social Welfare* 260-274

Fonjong, Fombe and Sama-Lang 2013 GeoJournal

Fonjong L, Fombe LF and Sama-Lang I "The Paradox of Gender Discrimination in Land Ownership and Women's Contribution to Poverty Reduction in Anglophone Cameroon" 2013 *GeoJournal* 575-589

Geschiere 1993 Africa

Geschiere P "Chiefs and Colonial Rule in Cameroon: Inventing Chieftaincy, French and British Style" 1993 *Africa: Journal of the International African Institute* 151-175

Gilbert 2017 ICLQ

Gilbert J "Litigating Indigenous Peoples' Rights in Africa: Potentials, Challenges and Limitations" 2017 *ICLQ* 657-686

Graham and Wiessner 2011 SAQ

Graham LM and Wiessner S "Indigenous Sovereignty, Culture, and International Human Rights Law" 2011 SAQ 403-427

Jarboe 2010 BC Third World LJ Jarboe MR "Collective Rights to Indigenous Land in Carcieri v Salazar" 2010 BC Third World LJ 395-415

Kameri-Mbote "I Want It and I Want It Now"

Kameri-Mbote "I Want It and I Want It Now: Women and Land in Africa" in Heinrich Böll Stiftung *Women and Land Rights: Questions of Access, Ownership and Control* (Heinrich Böll Stiftung Cape Town 2013) 6-9

Lang and Astadji 2018 GJAHSS

Lang MK and Astadji M "Insights into Francophone Cameroonians' Experiences in Active Participation in Protestant Churches and Mission in Bamenda, Cameroon" 2018 *GJAHSS* 1-13

Lanz 2000 Environment and History

Lanz TJ "The Origins, Development and Legacy of Scientific Forestry in Cameroon" 2000 *Environment and History* 99-120

Lekane and Asuelime 2016 J Contemp Hist

Lekane GM and Asuelime L "One Country, Three Colonial Legacies: The Politics of Colonialism, Capitalism and Development in the Pre- and Post-colonial Cameroon" 2016 *J Contemp Hist* 134-153

Mafa et al "Gender and Land Politics in Zimbabwe"

Mafa O *et al* "Gender and Land Politics in Zimbabwe" in Mafa O *et al* (ed) *Gender, Politics and Land Use in Zimbabwe 1980-2012* (Codesria Dakar 2015) 109-137

Mawoung 2001 African Study Monographs

Mawoung GN "The Relationship between the Bakola and the Bantu Peoples of the Coastal Regions of Cameroon and their Perception of Commercial Forest Exploitation" 2001 *African Study Monographs* 209-235

Ministry of Justice Cameroon *Report on Human Rights* Ministry of Justice Cameroon *Report by the Ministry of Justice on Human Rights in Cameroon in 2009* (The Ministry Yaounde 2009)

Money 2006/2007 Am Indian L Rev

Money M "How the Organisation of American States Took the Lead: The Development of Indigenous Peoples' Rights in the Americas" 2006/2007 Am Indian L Rev 553-571

Moreda 2017 Third World Q

Moreda T "Large-scale Land Acquisitions, State Authority and Indigenous Local Communities: Insights from Ethiopia" 2017 *Third World* Q 698-716

Ndahinda Indigenousness in Africa Ndahinda FM Indigenousness in Africa: A Contested Legal Framework for Empowerment of "Marginalized" Communities (Asser The Hague 2011)

Ndi and Batterbury 2017 *Africa Spectrum* Ndi FA and Batterbury S "Land Grabbing and the Axis of Political Conflicts: Insights from Southwest Cameroon" 2017 *Africa Spectrum* 33-63

Ndulo 2011 Ind J Global Legal Studies

Ndulo M "African Customary Law, Customs, and Women's Rights" 2011 Ind J Global Legal Studies 87-120

Nfah-Abbenyi 2016 *Tydskrif vir Letterkunde* Nfah-Abbenyi JM "Cameroon's National Literatures: An Introduction" 2016 *Tydskrif vir Letterkunde* 5-12

Nguh Implementing the Basic International Law Principles Nguh A Implementing the Basic International Law Principles Relating to Indigenous Peoples' Rights: A Case Study of Cameroon (LLM-dissertation University of the Western Cape 2013)

Nguiffo, Kenfack and Mballa "Influence of Historical and Contemporary Land Laws"

Nguiffo S, Kenfack PE and Mballa N "The Influence of Historical and Contemporary Land Laws on Indigenous Peoples' Land Rights in

Cameroon" in Couillard V (ed) Land Rights and the Forest Peoples of Africa: Historical, Legal and Anthropological Perspectives (Forest Peoples Programme Moreton-in-Marsh 2009) ch 2

Ngwa "Introduction to Land and Rural Women in Cameroon" Ngwa NE "Introduction to Land and Rural Women in Cameroon" in Fonjong LN (ed) *Issues on Women's Rights to Land in Cameroon* (Langaa Research and Publishing Bamenda 2012) 1-18

Njieassam Analysis of Legislative and Institutional Frameworks Njieassam EE An Analysis of Legislative and Institutional Frameworks Governing the Rights of Indigenous Peoples in Cameroon (PhD-thesis North-West University Mafikeng 2017)

Njoh 2013 IJURR

Njoh AJ "Equity, Fairness and Justice Implications of Land Tenure Formalization in Cameroon" 2013 *IJURR* 750-768

Njoh and Ananga 2016 Soc Indic Res

Njoh AJ and Ananga E "The Development Hypothesis of Women Empowerment in the Millennium Development Goals Tested in the Context Women's Access to Land in Africa" 2016 *Soc Indic Res* 91-104

Njoh et al 2017 Women's Stud Int Forum

Njoh AJ *et al* "Effects of Macro-economic Factors on Women's Formal Land Ownership Status in Cameroon" 2017 *Women's Stud Int Forum* 1-10

Ossome 2014 *Feminist Economics*

Ossome L "Can the Law Secure Women's Rights to Land in Africa? Revisiting Tensions between Culture and Land Commercialisation" 2014 *Feminist Economics* 155-177

Pelican 2009 American Ethnologist

Pelican M "Complexities of Indigeneity and Autochthony: An African Example" 2009 American Ethnologist 52-65

Pelican 2013 Anthropol Today

Pelican M "Insights from Cameroon: Five Years after the Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples" 2013 *Anthropol Today* 13-16

Pelican and Maruyama 2015 Afr Stud Monogr

Pelican M and Maruyama J "The Indigenous Rights Movement in Africa: Perspectives from Botswana and Cameroon" 2015 *Afr Stud Monogr* 49-74

Pemunta 2017 AJESD

Pemunta NV "When 'Property Cannot Own Property': Women's Lack of Property Rights in Cameroon" 2017 *AJESD* 67-85

Petesch 2012 Ethics and Social Welfare

Petesch P "Unlocking Pathways to Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality: The Good, the Bad, and the Sticky" 2012 *Ethics and Social Welfare* 234-246

Polavarapu 2013 Ga J Int'l & Comp L

Polavarapu A "Reconciling Indigenous and Women's Rights to Land in Sub-Saharan Africa" 2013 *Ga J Int'l & Comp L* 93-131

Rwegasira Land as a Human Right

Rwegasira A Land as a Human Right: A History of Land Law and Practice in Tanzania (Mkuki na Nyota Dar es Salaam 2012)

Same and Greenen Discourses, Fragmentation and Coalitions Same MT and Greenen S Discourses, Fragmentation and Coalitions: The Case of Herakles Farms' Large-Scale Land Deal in Cameroon (University of Antwerp Institute of Development Policy Antwerp 2015)

Sieder and Sierra Indigenous Women's Access to Justice Sieder R and Sierra MT Indigenous Women's Access to Justice in Latin America (Michelsen Institute Bergen 2010)

Sone Concept of Equality and Access to Land in Cameroon Sone PM The Concept of Equality and Access to Land in Cameroon: The Case of Anglophone Regions of Cameroon (PhD-thesis University of Buea 2011)

Sone 2012 J Soc Dev Afr

Sone PM "Access to Land in the Anglophone Regions of Cameroon: Challenges and Prospects" 2012 *J Soc Dev Afr* 85-112

Swing, Davidov and Schwartz 2012 J Dev Soc

Swing K, Davidov V and Schwartz B "Oil Development on Traditional Lands of Indigenous Peoples: Coinciding Perceptions on Two Continents" 2012 *J Dev Soc* 257-280

Verma 2014 Feminist Economics

Verma R "Land Grabs, Power, and Gender in East and Southern Africa: So, What's New?" 2014 *Feminist Economics* 52-75

Vermeulen and Cotula 2010 J Peasant Stud

Vermeulen S and Cotula L "Over the Heads of Local People: Consultation, Consent and Recompense in Large-scale Land Deals for Biofuels Projects in Africa" 2010 *J Peasant Stud* 899-916

Viljoen "Reflections on the Legal Protection of Indigenous People" Viljoen F "Reflections on the Legal Protection of Indigenous People's Rights in Africa" in Dersso S (ed) *Perspectives on the Rights of Minorities and Indigenous Peoples in Africa* (Pretoria University Law Press Pretoria 2010) 75-93

Wachira "Indigenous Peoples' Rights to Land and Natural Resources" Wachira GM "Indigenous Peoples' Rights to Land and Natural Resources" in Dersso S (ed) *Perspectives on the Rights of Minorities and Indigenous Peoples in Africa* (Pretoria University Law Press Pretoria 2010) 297-347

Whitehead and Tsikata 2003 J Agrar Change

Whitehead A and Tsikata D "Policy Discourse on Women's Land Rights in Sub-Sahara Africa: The Implications for the Re-turn to the Customary" 2003 *J Agrar Change* 67-112

Case law

Amodu Tijani v The Secretary, Southern Province Nigeria 1992 2 AC 399

Legislation

Constitution of the Republic of Cameroon, 1996 as amended

Crown Land Act, 1896

Land Law Ordinance No 74-1 of 6 July 1974

Land Tenure Law Ordinance 1 of 1927

Native Rights Ordinance 1 of 1916

Public Lands Ordinance 5 of 1903

International instruments

African Charter on Human and Peoples Rights (1981)

Charter of the United Nations (1945)

Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women (1979)

ILO Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention No 169 (1989)

International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (1966)

International Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Rights (1966)

UN Human Rights Council Report of the Independent Expert on minority issues, Addendum: Mission to Cameroon (2-11 September 2013) UN Doc A/HRC/25/56/Add.1 (2014)

Universal Declaration on Human Rights (1948)

United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (2007)

Internet sources

ACHPR 2010 http://www.achpr.org/states/cameroon/reports/2nd-2003-2005/

African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights 2010 *Cameroon: 2nd Periodic Report, 2003-2005* http://www.achpr.org/states/cameroon/reports/ 2nd-2003-2005/ accessed 21 February 2019

African Development Bank Group 2016 https://www.afdb.org/ fileadmin/uploads/afdb/Documents/Publications/Development_and_Indige nous_Peoples_in_Africa__En_-__v3_.pdf

African Development Bank Group 2016 *Development and Indigenous Peoples in Africa* https://www.afdb.org/fileadmin/uploads/afdb/ Documents/Publications/Development_and_Indigenous_Peoples_in_Afric a_En_-_v3_.pdf accessed 27 February 2018

Anadolu Agency 2017 https://www.dailysabah.com/feature/2017/08/03/ inside-cameroons-pygmy-community-traditions-lifestyle-and-religion Anadolu Agency 2017 *Inside Cameroon's Pygmy Community: Traditions, Lifestyle and Religion* https://www.dailysabah.com/feature/2017/08/03/ inside-cameroons-pygmy-community-traditions-lifestyle-and-religion accessed 21 February 2019

Anon 2017 http://pubs.iied.org/pdfs/17448IIED.pdf

Anon 2017 Indigenous Peoples' Land Rights in Cameroon: Progress till Date and Possible Futures http://pubs.iied.org/pdfs/17448IIED.pdf accessed 8 February 2018 Anter 2011 https://www.modernghana.com/news/349849/1/who-are-the-fulani-people-their-origins.html

Anter T 2011 *Who are the Fulani People and their Origins?* https://www.modernghana.com/news/349849/1/who-are-the-fulani-people-their-origins.html accessed 2 February 2019

Bouba 2012 http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/IPeoples/IFP/ Aeisatu_Bouba_December_2012.pdf

Bouba A 2012 *Mbororo Pastoralist, Cameroon* http://www.ohchr.org/ Documents/Issues/IPeoples/IFP/Aeisatu_Bouba_December_2012.pdf accessed 9 April 2018

CEDD, RACOPY and FPP 2010 http://www.forestpeoples.org/ en/partners/ced/publication/2010/situation-indigenous-peoples-cameroonsupplementary-report-un-committe

CED, RACOPY and FPP 2010 The Situation of Indigenous Peoples in Cameroon: A Supplementary Report Submitted in Connection with Cameroon's 15th-19th Periodic Reports http://www.forestpeoples.org/en/partners/ced/publication/2010/situation-indigenous-peoples-cameroon-supplementary-report-un-committe accessed 2 February 2019

Feiring 2013 http://www.landcoalition.org/sites/default/files/documents/ resources/InidgneousPeoplesRightsLandTerritoriesResources.pdf Feiring B 2013 Indigenous Peoples' Rights to Lands, Territories, and Resources

http://www.landcoalition.org/sites/default/files/documents/resources/Inidgn eousPeoplesRightsLandTerritoriesResources.pdf accessed 30 March 2018

IFAD date unknown https://www.ifad.org/documents/10180/3629656a-70f3-4c94-b58f-fd1e7ea2f4dc

IFAD date unknown Enhancing the Role of Indigenous Women in Sustainable Development: IFAD Experience with Indigenous in Latin America and Asia, Third Session of the Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues https://www.ifad.org/documents/10180/3629656a-70f3-4c94-b58ffd1e7ea2f4dc accessed 30 March 2018

ILO 2015 https://www.ilo.org/gender/Informationresources/Publications/ WCMS_438854/lang--en/index.htm

ILO 2015 Indigenous Peoples in Cameroon: A Guide for Media Professionals

https://www.ilo.org/gender/Informationresources/Publications/WCMS_438 854/lang--en/index.htm accessed 10 February 2018 Izsák 2012 https://www.right-docs.org/doc/a-hrc-19-56/

Izsák R 2012 Report of the Independent Expert on Minority Issues, Mission on Cameroon by UN Human Rights Council During the Twenty-fifth Session, Agenda Item 3, under the Topic the Promotion and Protection of all Human Rights, Civil, Political, Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Including the Right to Development https://www.right-docs.org/doc/a-hrc-19-56/ accessed 21 February 2019

Kameri-Mbote date unknown http://erepository.uonbi.ac.ke/bitstream/ handle/11295/41243/Fulltext?sequence=1

Kameri-Mbote P date unknown *Gender Issues in Land Tenure under Customary Law* http://erepository.uonbi.ac.ke/bitstream/handle/ 11295/41243/Fulltext?sequence=1 accessed 19 February 2018

Survival International date unknown http://wwwsurvivalinternationalorg/ tribes/pygmies

Survival International date unknown *Tribes – Pygmies* http://wwwsurvivalinternationalorg/tribes/pygmies accessed 2 February 2019

UN 2010 http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/unpfii/documents/Briefing Note6_GREY.pdf

UN Office of the Special Adviser on Gender Issues and Advancement of Women and the Secretariat of the United Nations Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues 2010 *Gender and Indigenous Peoples' Human Rights* http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/unpfii/documents/BriefingNote6_GREY.pdf accessed 6 March 2018

UN 2018 https://www.culturalsurvival.org/sites/default/files/UPR-report-Cameroon-2017.pdf

UN 2018 Observations on the State of Indigenous Human Rights in Cameroon Prepared for the 30th Session of the United Nations Human Rights Council - Universal Periodic Report https://www.culturalsurvival.org /sites/default/files/UPR-report-Cameroon-2017.pdf accessed 22 February 2018

WIPO 2013 http://www.wipo.int/export/sites/www/tk/en/resources/pdf/ overview_customary_law.pdf

WIPO 2013 Customary Law, Traditional Knowledge and Intellectual Property: An Outline of the Issues http://www.wipo.int/export/sites/ www/tk/en/resources/pdf/overview_customary_law.pdf accessed 19 February 2018 World Rainforest Women 2016 http://wrm.org.uy/articles-from-the-wrmbulletin/section1/women-and-property-in-cameroon-laws-and-reality/ World Rainforest Women 2016 *Women and Property in Cameroon: Laws and Reality* http://wrm.org.uy/articles-from-the-wrm-bulletin/section1/ women-and-property-in-cameroon-laws-and-reality/ accessed 19 February 2018

List of Abbreviations

ACHPR	African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights
Afr Stud Monogr	African Study Monographs
AJESD	African Journal Economic and Sustainable
	Development
Am Indian L Rev	American Indian Law Review
Am U Int'I L Rev	American University International Law
	Review
Anthropol Today	Anthropology Today
Ariz J Int'l & Comp L	Arizona Journal of International and
	Comparative Law
ASSR	African Social Science Review
BC Third World LJ	Boston College Third World Law Journal
CED	Centre pour l'Environnement et le
	Développement
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of all Forms
	of Discrimination against Women
ESJ	European Scientific Journal
FPP	Forest Peoples Programme
Ga J Int'I & Comp L	Georgia Journal of International and
	Comparative Law
GJAHSS	Global Journal of Arts, Humanities and
	Social Sciences
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political
	Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social
	and Cultural Rights
ICLQ	International and Comparative Law
	Quarterly
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural
	Development

IJRAFS	International Journal of Research in
	Agriculture and Food Science
IJURR	International Journal of Urban and Regional
	Research
ILO	International Labour Organisation
Ind J Global Legal Studies	Indiana Journal of Global Legal Studies
J Agrar Change	Journal of Agrarian Change
J Contemp Hist	Journal of Contemporary History
J Dev Soc	Journal of Developing Societies
J Hum Ecol	Journal of Human Ecology
J Peasant Stud	Journal of Peasant Studies
J Soc Dev Afr	Journal of Social Development in Africa
JLCR	Journal of Law and Conflict Resolution
JMAS	Journal of Modern African Studies
PGDT	Perspectives on Global Development and
	Technology
RACOPY	Réseau Recherches Actions Concertées
	Pygmées
SAQ	South Atlantic Quarterly
Soc Indic Res	Social Indicators Research
Third World Q	Third World Quarterly
Tul Envtl LJ	Tulane Environmental Law Journal
UDHR	Universal Declaration on Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNDRIP	United Nations Declaration on the Rights of
	Indigenous Peoples
WIPO	World Intellectual Property Organisation
Women's Stud Int Forum	Women's Studies International Forum