

*Department of Leadership, Higher and Adult Education
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education
University of Toronto*

WOMEN, MIGRATION, AND WORK

LHA 1147

Winter Session 2019

Dr. Shahrzad Mojab

Thursdays: 2:00-5:00

Room 3-310

Office Hours: Room 7-116, by appointment; **E-mail** Shahrzad.mojab@utoronto.ca

Acknowledging our history

*The University of Toronto is on Indigenous land, which for thousands of years has been the traditional land of the Huron-Wendat, the Seneca and, most recently, the Mississaugas of the Credit River. Today, this meeting place is still the home to many Indigenous people from across Turtle Island, many of whom continue to fight against colonization, extractive industries, and gendered oppression. To understand contemporary migrations, we must begin by acknowledging the historical colonial migrations that resulted in conquest and expropriation of Indigenous land and understanding the ongoing legacies of patriarchal colonialism, capitalism and imperialism that continue to displace, dispossess, and **resettle** people into the capitalist social relations which **unsettle** them to begin with.*

COURSE DESCRIPTION

This course will focus on the gender, race, and class dimensions of population movement and forced migration. The focal point of the course will be the understanding of work-related experiences of migrant and refugee women. Reading theories of migration in the context of circulation, distribution, and appropriation of capital, we explore the flow of migration and labour market in Canada, globally and transnationally. Two forms of movements will be explored: Movements of people and movements of jobs. The adjustment and transformation of market economy in response to these movements will be studied. Emphasis will be on the challenges faced by women migrants and refugee as they navigate changing labor markets in search of waged work.

The majority of the world population is ‘on the move.’ War, environmental disasters, massive restructuring of certain sectors of economy, such as services, agriculture, and manufacturing, are forces to displace population mostly from the global south. This displacement is both internal and external and mostly moves from rural areas towards urban centres globally. The rise of urbanization has profound impact on the nature and the condition of work, more specifically on access to jobs, training, learning, and skilling required to gain waged work.

The course will pay careful attention to competing theoretical analyses of the relationship between gender, race, class in the context of work and migration. We will discuss critical feminist and race theories, Marxist feminist analysis, transnational, diaspora, mobility and cultural studies, adult education, and theorizations of learning and work. The course relies on theoretical studies and pays attention to social relations, politics, policies, and practices of migration and work. We will read policy documents, reports, novels, and artistic pieces including watching films which present us with the complexities of the themes covered in the course.

COURSE SPECIFIC OBJECTIVES

The learning objectives of the course are:

- 1) To understand the relationship between capitalism, forced migration and displacement.
- 2) To acquire knowledge on the relationship between the social categories of ‘refugee,’ or ‘migrant’ and work, learning, training, and skilling.
- 3) To develop critical analysis of national and global policies on women, migration and work.
- 4) To be able to extend critical race, gender, and class analyses to migration, settlement, work and learning.

COURSE POLICIES & GUIDELINES

Respecting Our Learning Community

In teaching/learning settings, I see my role primarily as an analytical and reflective practitioner, planner and facilitator. We all will be involved in a participatory learning effort; your experience and input are as significant as the accumulated knowledge on the topic. This course, like all courses, has its own politics. We will discuss and we will disagree. It is of the utmost importance that we disagree respectfully and engage in productive, generative conversation. The expectation of this course is that students conduct themselves in a collegial and respectful manner in class, out of class, and within on-line formats. Class sessions will operate as seminars. In collaborative learning we depend on one another to make the experience rich and useful. Therefore, I expect you to attend all class sessions and to actively participate in discussions. In order to enrich your participation, you are expected to devote sufficient time to reading, engage deeply with theoretical debates, and accomplishing learning activities prior to class sessions.

Contacting the Instructor

Please feel free to contact me via university email (see above for address). Please use your university provided account to communicate with me. Emails will be returned in a timely manner, but not necessarily immediately☺. In lieu of office hours, please contact me to make an appointment if you have a question.

Extensions & Late Assignments

10% will be deducted from the assignment for each day the assignment is late. Assignments will be accepted late without penalty if accompanied by a doctor's note indicating a medically valid reason for an inability to complete the assignment on time. Requests for extensions made with less than 24 hours will not be considered and the assignment will be considered late, with points deducted accordingly.

Academic Integrity & Student Conduct

It is expected that all students will adhere to university policies on academic integrity and student conduct in the classroom. All assignments will be written in a standardized and accepted stylistic form (APA). For more information on how not to cheat in this class, please see:

<http://www.writing.utoronto.ca/advice/using-sources/how-not-to-plagiarize>

LEARNING ACTIVITIES & ASSAIGNMENTS

The primary objective of the learning activities is to enhance your skills in theoretical analysis and engaged/critical reading and writing of texts. In assessing your learning, I will focus attention on the following factors:

1. An active level of participation.
2. Evidence of your ability to integrate new knowledge and to effectively communicate your understanding in writing.
3. Evidence of your ability to critically analyse and engage with alternative perspectives.
4. Quality, clarity and focus in writing.

Participation & Preparation (20%)

Attendance is extremely important for full engagement in this course. Your presence and active engagement are expected. I strongly encourage students to discuss with me any circumstances that may affect their participation in class. It is expected that all students will come to class having completed the assigned readings. Class time will be discussion heavy and students should be prepared to discuss readings in both small and large group formats. Participation points will be allocated based on active engagement with course content and peers.

In reviewing each reading, think about the following questions:

- What is the author's main argument?
- How does the author support her/his argument?
- How does the author define key concepts?
- What are the political, personal, and intellectual implications of the author's arguments?
- What is your critique of the author's argument, assumptions, evidence?
- What questions do this reading raise for you?
- What did you learn from this reading?

A theme-based paper (30%)

You will be expected to write an analytical review paper based on the theme covered in the course before. The review should be no more than 1000 words and should analyze the readings under the selected theme.

Review is due on **February 14**.

Policy or Report Review Presentation (30%)

Working in pairs or threes, you will be asked to review one or more national or global policy documents or reports that relate to the course content. I will share some suggestions in class. This assignment is worth 30% of the total grade, and everyone on the “team” will receive the same grade. The presentation sessions are scheduled for the month of **March**.

Final Paper (30%)

Each student will complete a major course paper (maximum 3000 words) on the subject of their choosing related to course themes. Final paper is due by **April 10**.

Please keep a copy of all your assignments and put your email address on the covering page. Electronic version of assignments, that is, fax, email, or attachments will NOT be accepted. Assignments should be formatted in standard 12-point font, 1-inch margins, double-spaced. The use of electronic devices is NOT permitted in class except with the instructor’s permission.

COURSE MATERIALS

Reading assignments include book chapters and a number of articles from diverse sources. Other readings may be assigned during the conduct of this course. We may also cover topics other than the ones listed for each week. In planning the seminar readings, I have made arrangements for the use of additional resources including video, film, or documentary presentations or guest speakers.

Weekly readings for this course are available on-line through University of Toronto libraries or on the Quercus. You must have an active UTORid to access online journals. The reading load in this course is intentionally constructed to demand your careful attention; please come to class prepared to participate.

SEMINAR TOPICS AND READINGS

January 10

Introduction: The Context, Key Questions & Theoretical Approaches

January 17

Capitalism & Work: A Theoretical Exploration

Selected Topics: waged labour; labour power; gendered, racialized, and class nature of work and migration; the right to work; movements of work/jobs and their impact on migrant and refugee women; population displacement, racialization, security and precarity.

1. Colley, Helen (2015). "Labour-power," in Shahrzad Mojab (ed.). *Marxism and Feminism*. London: Zed Books: 221-238.
<http://myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/login?url=http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/utoronto/detail.action?docID=4708380>
2. Murphy, Michelle (2015). "Reproduction," in S. Mojab (ed.). *Marxism and Feminism*. London: Zed Books: 287-304.
<http://myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/login?url=http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/utoronto/detail.action?docID=4708380>
3. Ferguson, Susan and David McNally (2015). "Precarious migrants: Gender, race and the social reproduction of a global working class," *The Socialist Register*: 1-23.
4. Federici, S. (2014). "The reproduction of labour power in the global economy and the unfinished feminist revolution," in Maurizio Atzeni (ed.). *Workers and Labour in Globalized Capitalism: Contemporary Themes and Theoretical Issues*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

January 24

Migrant and Refugee Women in the Capitalist Market

Selected Topics: Migration and the state; imperialism; globalization; imperialism and labour market trends; class mobility; transnational inequality.

5. Phizacklea, Annie (2001). "Women, migration and the state," in Kum-Kum Bhavnani (ed.). *Feminism and Race*. Oxford: Oxford University Press: 319-330.
<http://ebookcentral.proquest.com.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/lib/utoronto/detail.action?docID=5602480>
6. Yeşilyurt Gündüz, Zuhul (2013). "The feminization of migration: Care and the new emotional imperialism," *Monthly Review*. 65 (7).
7. Chang, Grace "Global exchange: The World Bank 'welfare reform' and the trade in migrant women," in Grace Chang *Disposable Domesticity; Immigrant Women Workers in the Global Economy*. Cambridge, Massachusetts; South End Press: 123-151.
8. Zaman, Habiba (2006). *Breaking the Iron Wall: Decommmodification and Immigrant Women's Labor in Canada*. Toronto: Lexington Books.

Chapter 2: “Globalization, neo-liberal globalism, and migration”: 21-38.

9. Salazar Parreñas, Rachel (2001). *Servants of Globalization: Women, Migration and Domestic Work*. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press.

Chapter 6: “Contradictory class mobility: The politics of domestic work in globalization”: 150-196.

Conclusion: “servants of globalization: Different settings, parallel lives”: 243-256.

<http://ebookcentral.proquest.com.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/lib/utoronto/detail.action?docID=3037404>

10. McDowell, Linda (2008). “Thinking through work: complex inequalities, constructions of difference and trans-national migrants.” *Progress in Human Geography* 32: 491-507.

January 31 Global Labour Export: Women and Work

Selected Topics: Racialized work, colonialism and labour export; family and work; racialization of work

11. Robyn Magalit Rodriguez (2010). *Migrants for Export: How the Philippine State Brokers Labor to the World*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Chapter 1: “The emergence of labor brokerage: U.S. Colonial legacies in the Philippines”: pp. 1-18.

Chapter 2: “A global enterprise of labor: mobilizing migrants for export”: pp. 19-49.

Chapter 5: “The Philippine domestic: Gendered labor, family, and the nation-state”: pp. 93-115.

<http://ebookcentral.proquest.com.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/lib/utoronto/detail.action?docID=548071>

12. Lewis, Gail (2001), “Black women’s employment and the British economy,” in Kum-Kum Bhavnani (ed.). *Feminism and Race*. Oxford: Oxford University Press: 297-318.

February 7 & 14 Work, Learning, Training, and Skilling among Refugee and Migrant Women

Selected Topics: Migration and the shifting context of learning and training; the ideological construction of skilling; transnational learning.

February 7

13. Ng, Roxana and Hongxia Shan (2010), "Lifelong learning as ideological practice: An analysis from the perspective of immigrant women in Canada," *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 29 (2): 169-184.
https://journals-scholarsportal-info.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/pdf/02601370/v29i0002/169_llaipapoiwic.xml
14. Brigham, Susan and Catherine Baillie Abidi, and Sylvia Calatayud (2018). "Migrant women learning and teaching through participatory photography," *The Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education*, 30 (2): 101-114.
<http://web.b.ebscohost.com.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/ehost/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=1&sid=37bf88bc-d2bf-4c69-bb92-f7d33b4d0700%40sessionmgr104>
15. Shan, Hongxia (2009). "Shaping the re-training and re-education experiences of immigrant women: The credential and certificate regime in Canada." *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 28 (3): 353-369.
https://journals-scholarsportal-info.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/pdf/02601370/v28i0003/353_strarecacric.xml
16. Mojab, Shahrzad (2000). "The power of economic globalization: Deskilling immigrant women through training," Cervero, Ron M. and Arthur L. Wilson (eds.) *Power in Practice: Adult Education and Struggle for Knowledge and Power in Society*. New York: Jossey-Bass, pp. 23-41.
<http://ebookcentral.proquest.com.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/lib/utoronto/detail.action?docID=117436>

February 14

Theme-based Review is Due

17. Creese, Gillian and Brandy Wiebe (2009). "'Survival employment': Gender and deskilling among African immigrants in Canada," *International Migration*, 50 (5): 56-76.
<https://onlinelibrary-wiley-com.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/doi/epdf/10.1111/j.1468-2435.2009.00531.x>
18. Mirchandani, K. (2015). Flesh in voice: The no-touch embodiment of transnational customer service workers. *Organization*, 22 (6), 909-923.
https://journals-scholarsportal-info.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/pdf/13505084/v22i0006/909_fivtneotcsw.xml
19. Vandegrift, Darcie (2008). "This isn't Paradise-I work here": Global restructuring, the tourism industry, and women workers in Caribbean Costa Rica," *Gender and Society*, 22 (6): 778-798.
20. Monkman, Karen (1999). "Transnational migration and learning processes of Mexican adults constructing lives in California," *International Journal of Educational Development*, 19: 367-382.
https://journals-scholarsportal-info.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/pdf/07380593/v19i4-5/367_tmalpomaalic.xml

February 21 & 28

Visible Work, Invisible Labour: Race, Gender, and Class

Selected Topics: Domestic labour; migration regimes; factory work, care work; ethnicity and work; citizenship and work; and working and labouring

February 21

21. Bianet Castellanos, M. (2010). *A Return to Servitude: Maya Migration and the Tourist Trade in Cancún*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Chapter 4: “Civilizing bodies: Learning to labor in Cancún”: 77-109.

<http://ebookcentral.proquest.com.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/lib/utoronto/detail.action?docID=635542>

22. Zaman, Habiba (2006). *Breaking the Iron Wall: Decommodification and Immigrant Women’s Labor in Canada*. Toronto: Lexington Books.

Chapter 4: “The Canadian state and immigrant labour: Intersections of gender, class, and race”: pp. 61-72.

23. Cecilia Rivas (2016). “El Salvador Works”: The creation and negotiation of a national brand and the transnational imaginary,” In Mirchandani, Kiran and Winifred R. Poster (eds.). *Borders in Service: Enactments of Nationhood in Transnational Call Centres*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press: 35-57.
24. Sweet, Elizabeth L., Sang S. Lee and Sara Ortiz Escalante (2012), “‘A slow assassination of your soul’: Race, citizenship and gender identities in the borderlands of new economic places,” *Transnational Migration, Gender and Rights*, 10:99-126.

February 28

25. Ying Zhang, Tracy (2012). “Factory ‘nuns’: The ethnicization of migrant labor in the making of Tibetan carpets,” *Gender, Place & Culture: A Journal of Feminist Geography*, 20 (6): 754-772.
26. Salazar Parreñas, Rachel (2006). *Children of Global Migration: Transnational Families and Gendered Woes*. Manila Philippines: Ateneo De Manila University Press.

Chapter 1: “The global economy of care,” pp.12-29.

Chapter 5: “The gender paradox: Recreating ‘the family’ in women’s migration,” pp. 92-119.

27. Goldring, Luin and Marie-Pier Joly. 2014. “Immigration, citizenship and racialization at work: Unpacking employment precarity in southwestern Ontario.” *Just Labour* 22 (Autumn) 94-121.
28. Marchand, Marianne (2014). “Mexican migrant transnationalism and imaginaries of temporary/permanent belonging,” in Vosko, Leah F., Valerie Preston, and Robert Latham (eds.).

Liberating temporariness? Migration, Work, and Citizenship in an Age of Insecurity. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press: 285-304.

<http://ebookcentral.proquest.com.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/lib/utoronto/detail.action?docID=3332770>

29. Canefe, Nergis (2018). *The Syrian Exodus in Context: Crisis, Dispossession and Mobility in the Middle East*. Istanbul: Istanbul Bilgi University Press.

Chapter 5: "Invisible lives: Gender, hyper-precarity and Syrian Refugee women," pp.130-145.

http://go.galegroup.com.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/ps/retrieve.do?tabID=T002&resultListType=RESULT_LIST&searchResultsType=SingleTab&searchType=AdvancedSearchForm¤tPosition=11&docId=GALE%7CA547988464&docType=Essay&sort=Relevance&contentSegment=&prodId=AONE&contentSet=GALE%7CA547988464&searchId=R1&userGroupName=utoronto_main&inPS=true

March 7

State, Migration and Work: Policy Implications

Policy/Report Review Presentation

Selected Topics: Migrant and refugee rights; participation; politicization; temporariness; transnational organization.

30. Fernández, Emily E. Arnold and Stewart Pollock (2013). "Refugees' rights to work," *FMR* 44: 92-93.
31. Cox, Rosie (2012). "Gendered work and migration regimes," *Transnational Migration, Gender and Rights*, 10:33-52.
32. Goldring, L. (2009). "Migrant political participation and development: Re-politicizing development and re-socializing politics," in J. DeWind and J. Holdaway (eds.), *Migration and Development: Future Directions for Research and Policy*. New York: Social Science Research Council: 218-243.
<http://essays.ssrc.org/developmentpapers/wp-content/uploads/2009/08/15Goldring.pdf>
33. Hari, Amirta (2014). "Temporariness, rights, and citizenship: The latest chapter in Canada's exclusionary migration and refugee history," *Refuge*, 30 (2): 35-44.
34. Satzewich, Vic (2015). *Points of Entry: How Canada's Immigration Officers Decide Who Gets In*. Vancouver: UBC Press.

Chapter 7: "Federal skilled workers": 164-186.

35. Bhuyan. R. (2012). “Negotiating citizenship on the frontlines: How the devolution of Canadian immigration policy shapes service delivery to women fleeing abuse,” *Law & Policy*. 34(2): 211-236.

March 14: March Break

March 21 Migrant and Refugee Women Organizing

Policy/Report Review Presentation

Selected Topics: The right to work; decent work; class conflict; contradictions and possibilities

36. Zaman, Habiba (2006). *Breaking the Iron Wall: Decommodification and Immigrant Women’s Labor in Canada*. Toronto: Lexington Books.

Chapter 8: “Immigrant women as agents of change: The role of networks and association”: 135-154.

37. Vosko, L. (2002). “Decent work’: The shifting role of the ILO and the struggle for global social justice,” *Global Social Policy*, 2 (1): 19-46.
38. Kabeer, N (2004), “Globalization, labor standards, and women’s rights: Dilemmas of collective (in)action in an interdependent world,” *Feminist Economics*, 18 (2): 10-43.
39. Riaño-Alcalá, Pilar and Luin Goldring (2014). “Unpacking refugee community transnational organizing: The challenges and diverse experiences of Colombians in Canada.” *Refugee Survey Quarterly* 33(2): 1-28.
40. Ness, Immanuel (2014). “Labour migration and emergent class conflict: Corporate neo-liberalism, worker mobility, and labour resistance in the US,” in Maurizio Atzeni (ed.). *Workers and Labour in Globalized Capitalism: Contemporary Themes and Theoretical Issues*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

March 28 Policy/Report Review Presentation

April 4 (Re)thinking, Reflecting: Women, Migration and Work

Federici, Sylvia (2019). *Re-Enchanting the World: Feminism and the Politics of the Commons*. Oakland, California: PM Press: pp. 151-187.

BOOKS

- ❖ Atzeni, Maurizio (ed.) (2014). *Workers and Labour in Globalized Capitalism: Contemporary Themes and Theoretical Issues*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- ❖ Bhavnani, Kum-Kum (ed.) (2001). *Feminism and Race*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- ❖ Canefe, Nergis (2018). *The Syrian Exodus in Context: Crisis, Dispossession and Mobility in the Middle East*. Istanbul: Istanbul Bilgi University Press.
- ❖ Chang, Grace (2000). *Disposable Domestic: Immigrant Women Workers in the Global Economy*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: South End Press.
- ❖ Federici, Sylvia (2019). *Re-Enchanting the World: Feminism and the Politics of the Commons*. Oakland, California: PM Press: pp. 151-187.
- ❖ Mirchandani, Kiran and Winifred R. Poster (eds.). *Borders in Service: Enactments of Nationhood in Transnational Call Centres*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- ❖ Mojab, Shahrzad (ed.) (2015). *Marxism and Feminism*. London: Zed Books.
- ❖ Rodriguez, Robyn Magalit (2010). *Migrants for Export: How the Philippine State Brokers*.
- ❖ Salazar Parreñas, Rachel (2006). *Children of Global Migration: Transnational Families and Gendered Woes*. Manila Philippines: Ateneo De Manila University Press.
- ❖ Salazar Parreñas, Rhacel (2001). *Servants of Globalization: Women, Migration and Domestic Work*. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press.
- ❖ Satzewich, Vic (2015). “Federal skilled workers,” *Points of Entry: How Canada’s Immigration Officers Decide Who Gets In*. Vancouver: UBC Press.
- ❖ Vosko, Leah F., Valerie Preston, and Robert Latham (eds.) (2014). *Liberating temporariness? Migration, Work, and Citizenship in an Age of Insecurity*. Montreal: McGill-Queen’s University Press.
- ❖ Zaman, Habiba (2006). *Breaking the Iron Wall: Decommodification and Immigrant Women’s Labor in Canada*. Toronto: Lexington Books.

FILMS

- ♣ *The True Cost* (2015). Directed by Andrew Morgan.
- ♣ *Made in L.A. (Hecho en Los Angeles)* (2007). Directed by Almudena Carracedo. <http://www.madeinla.com/>
- ♣ *Maid in Lebanon*. (2006). Directed by Carol Mansour
- ♣ *Modern Heroes, Modern Slaves*. (1997). Directed by Marie Boti. Project Multimonde/CBC. <http://pmm.qc.ca/>

NOVELS

- ♣ Shaun Tan (2006). *The Arrival*
- ♣ Jimmy Santiago Baca (2010). *Glass of Water*
- ♣ Daniel Rothenberg (2000). *With These Hands: The Hidden World of Migrant Farmworkers Today*
- ♣ Lawrence Hill (2016). *The Illegal*
- ♣ Kamal Al-Solaylee (2016). *Brown*