

Beyond Victims and Guardian Angels: Feminist Perspectives on Third World Women and Gender in Economic Development

ID 209/ IDCE354 /WST 353 (IDCE354)
Professor: Kiran Asher (kasher@clarku.edu)
Office Hours: Tu 12:30- 1:30 p m; W 4-5 pm
Office: 10 Hawthorne St, #31

W: 9:00 am – noon
Meets in: WS Conference Rm
Tel: 421-3823

Course focus and goals:

How did "third world women" and "gender" concerns enter economic development discourses? How have "third world women" and "gender" been conceptualized within development practices? In turn, how have feminist theories about women and gender shaped economic development discourses? What roles have third world women implicitly and explicitly played in the development enterprise? Have these roles been acknowledged and understood? Have institutional and theoretical interventions "improved" the lives of third world women? In exploring these issues, this research seminar will eschew the divide between "theory" and "praxis" that plagues development literature.

Required Readings:

- ❖ Briggs, Laura. 2002. *Reproducing Empire: Race, Sex, Science, and U. S. Imperialism in Puerto Rico*. Univ. of California Press. (ISBN 0-520-23258-5)
- ❖ Kabeer, Naila. 1994. *Reversed Realities: Gender Hierarchies in Development Thought*. Verso. ISBN 0-86091-584-0
- ❖ Sen, G. and C. Grown. 1987. *Development, Crises, and Alternative Visions*. NY: Monthly Review Press. ISBN 0-85345-717-4
- ❖ Visvanathan, Nalini, Lynn Duggan, Laurie Nisonoff and Nan Wieggersma, eds. 1997. *The Women, Gender and Development Reader*. Zed Books (The WGD Reader)
- ❖ Vol 26, no. 4, Special Issue of Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society on Gender and Globalization. <http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/Signs/>
- ❖ A Course Reader (Electronic or Print – to be decided in class)

Recommended and background Readings:

- ❖ Braidotti, R., E. Charkiewicz, S. Häusler, and S. Wieringa. 1994. *Women, the Environment and Sustainable Development: Towards a Theoretical Synthesis*. London: Zed Books.
- ❖ Farmer, Paul, Margaret Connors, and Janie Simmons. eds. 1996. *Women, Poverty, and AIDS: Sex, Drugs, and Structural Violence*. Monroe, ME: Common Courage Press.
- ❖ Marchand, M. and J. Parpart, eds. 1995. *Feminism/Postmodernism/Development (F/P/D)*. NY: Routledge.
- ❖ Isbister, John. 1991. *Promises not kept: the Betrayal of Social Change in the Third World*. West Hartford, CT: Kumarian Press.
- ❖ A writing guide such as Diana Hacker's 2003. *A Writer's Reference*. St Martin's Press. 5th edition; OR

- ❖ A style manual such as Hacker’s 2000. *A Pocket Manual of Style*. 3rd edition. St Martin’s Press, or Strunk and White’s *Elements of Style*. 4th edition. Longman.

**Required (unless you have a schedule conflict with another class)
Attendance at the Fall 2005, IDCE Speakers Series which will focus on issues of women, gender and development. Most talks will be from noon-1:30 pm on Thursdays. Occassionally the talks will be a different time.**

Assignments, Grades and Instructions:

A research seminar is a collective endeavor and its success depends on your active participation and engagement. Being a little late for one seminar, missing a session, or not posting one annotation is understandable. Beyond this occasional lapse, I will be forced assume that your priorities lie elsewhere and you will feel the consequences in such crass terms as lower grades. Grades will be assigned as follows:

- ❖ Attendance and Participation (including weekly annotations and how you engage and respond to other’s ideas and writings) (40%)
- ❖ Reading Review of *Reproducing Empire* (10%)
- ❖ Research and in-class presentation of the institutionalization of “gender” in third world development and politics (10%)
- ❖ Final Literature Review Essay (40%)

Detailed instructions on seminar assignments, my grading criteria and guidelines for research and writing are posted on Blackboard (echalk.clarku.edu). Manage your time to meet indicated deadlines and due dates. By handing in assignments late you forfeit your right to comments and loose half a letter grade for every day that your work is late.

Feedback and Comments:

- ❖ I encourage you to come see me during my office hours to talk through material that is hard to grasp, follow-up on class discussions, or brainstorm research ideas.
- ❖ I will also be happy to give you feedback on drafts of your work. My comments will be designed to help you revise and improve your final essay. To get most out of my feedback, please follow the steps and scheduled outlined in ID209writing.doc

Course Schedule: This is a working course schedule and is subject to change.

Week 1, Aug 31: Introduction to the seminar and its approaches and a mandatory library session at Goddard (10:30-11:45 am).

- ❖ For those of you who need a refresher on development theory and approaches, please see Isbister’s “Promises Not Kept” which is on reserve at Goddard and IDCE

- ❖ Assignment 1: 2-3 page reading review (10% of grade) on *Reproducing Empire* due in my office by noon, Tuesday, Sept 6. See details at the end of the syllabus.

Week 2, Sept 7: Overpopulation, Reproduction, Gender and Development – a history

- ❖ Briggs, Laura. *Reproducing Empire* Introduction
- ❖ Visvanathan, N. General Introduction and Intro to Part I (WGD Reader)
- ❖ Tinker, I. *The Making of a Field: Advocates, Practitioners and Scholars* (WGD)
- ❖ Kabeer, *The Emergence of Women as a Constituency in Development*, Chpt 1 in *Reversed Realities: Gender Hierarchies in Development Thought*.
- ❖ Introduction of seminar participants

Week 3, Sept 14: An overview on debates about women, gender and development

- ❖ Briggs, Laura. *Reproducing Empire* Chpts 4-6 (skim chpts 1-3)

SEPT 16-17: Please attend the Women’s Studies Conference at Clark

Week 4, Sept 21: Women-in-Development: Equity, Efficiency and Integration and The Theoretical Underpinnings and Critiques of WID

- ❖ Boserup, E. 1970. Chpts 1, 3, 6, 9 *Women's Role in Economic Development*. NY: St. Martin's Press. (CR)
- ❖ Beneria and Sen. *Accumulation, reproduction and women's role in economic development: Boserup revisited* (WGD)
- ❖ Kabeer, The Theoretical Underpinnings of WID (Chpt 2) in *Reversed Realities*
- ❖ Chowdhry, Geeta. 1995. Engendering Development? Women in Development (WID) in international development regimes. Pp. 26-41 in F/P/D (CR)

Week 5, Sept 28: Gender and Development (GAD): Structural Issues

- ❖ Kabeer, Structural Perspectives on Women and Dev, Chpt 3 in *Reversed Realities*
- ❖ Chpts 4 (Young), Intro to Part 3, and Chpts 17-19 (Elson and Pearson, Fernandez-Kelly, and Lim), 22 (Deere et al), 30 (Beneria), skim chpts 20, 21 (Arizpe and Tripp) (WGD Reader)
- ❖ Farmer, Paul. 1996. Women, Poverty, and AIDS (Chpt 1). Pp. 3-38 in Farmer, Paul, Margaret Connors, and Janie Simmons. eds. 1996. *Women, Poverty, and AIDS : Sex, Drugs, and Structural Violence*. Monroe, ME: Common Courage Press. (CR)
- ❖ Highly Recommended but optional: Farmer, Paul et al. 1996. Rereading Social Science (Chpt 5). Pp. 147-205 in *Women, Poverty, and AIDS*

Week 6, Oct 5: “Empowering” Third World Women

- ❖ Sen, G. and C. Grown. 1987. *Development, Crises, and Alternative Visions*
- ❖ Kabeer, Development from a Gender Perspective, Chpt 4 in *Reversed Realities*
- ❖ Hirshman, Mitu. 1995. Women in Development: A Critique. In F/P/D. (CR)

FALL BREAK (Oct 10-11)

Week 7, Oct 12: Feminist theories of “gender” and power (meet 6-9 pm?)

- ❖ Waylen, Georgina. 1996. Analysing Gender in the Politics of the Third World. Pp. 5-23, in *Gender and Politics in the Third World Politics*. Lynne Rienner Publ. (CR)
- ❖ Scott, Joan W. 1988. Gender: A Useful Category of Historical Analysis. Pp. 28-50 in *Gender and the Politics of History*. New York Columbia University Press. (CR)
- ❖ Kabeer, Empowerment from Below, Chpt 9 in *Reversed Realities* (SKIM)

Week 8, Oct 19: Theorizing “third world women”

- ❖ Mohanty, Chandra, Talpade. 1991. "Under Western Eyes": Feminist scholarship and colonial discourse. Pp. 51-80 in Mohanty, C. T., A. Russo, and L. Torres, eds. *Third World Women and the Politics of Feminism*. Bloomington: Indiana UP. (CR)
- ❖ Mohanty, “Under Western Eyes” Revisited: Feminist Solidarity through Anticapitalist Struggles. Pp. 221-251 in *Feminism Without Borders: Decolonizing Theory, Practicing Solidarity*. Duke University Press. (CR)
- ❖ Udayagiri, M. 1995. Challenging Modernization: Gender and Development, postmodern feminism and activism. Pp. 159-177 in F/P/D (CR)
- ❖ Freeman, C. 2001. Is Local:Global as Feminine: Masculine? Rethinking the Gender of Globalization. *Signs; Jour. of Women in Culture and Society* 26(4): 1008-1037 (CR)

Week 9, Oct 26: Third World Women, Gender, Nations, and States

- ❖ Schild, Veronica. 1998. New Subjects of Rights? Women's Movements and the Construction of Citizenship in the “New Democracies.” Pp. 93-117 in *Cultures of Politics, Politics of Culture: Re-visioning Latin American Social Movements*. Alvarez, S. E., E. Dagnino, and A. Escobar. Westview Press. (CR)
- ❖ Enloe, C. 1989. Nationalism and Masculinity. Pp. 42-64 in *Bananas, Beaches and Bases: Making Feminist Sense of Int'l Politics*. Univ of California Press (CR)
- ❖ Wieggersma, Intro to Part 4C, Chpts 27-29 (Aguilar, Afshar, Hoodfar in WGD)
- ❖ Read ANY ONE of the following two selections (both are in CR)
 - ❖ Oza, Rupal. 2001. Showcasing India: Gender, Geography, and Globalization. *Signs; Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 26(4): 1067-1095
 - ❖ Moghadam, Valentine. 1992. Revolution, Islam and Women: Sexual Politics in Iran and Afghanistan. Pp. 424-446 in *Nationalisms and Sexualities*. Parker, A., M. Russo, D. Sommer, and P. Yaeger, eds. Routledge.

Week 10, Nov 2: Gender, Agricultural and Natural Resource Development, and “Environmental Management”

- ❖ Chpts 5, 6, 7, 25 (Braidotti et al, Shiva, Agarwal, Hartmann in WGD)
- ❖ Spivak Chakravorty, G. 1995. Empowering Women. *Environment* 37(1): (CR)
- ❖ Ahmed, Sara. 1993. *Gendering the Rural Environment: Concepts and Issues for Practice*. Anand, India: Institute of Rural Management Workshop Report (CR)
- ❖ Read ANY ONE of the following two selections (both are in CR)

- ❖ Sundar, Nandini. 2001. Beyond the Bounds? Violence at the Margins of New Legal Geographies. Pp. 328-353 in *Violent Environments*. Nancy Lee Peluso and Michael Watts, eds. Duke Univ Press
- ❖ Baviskar, Amita. 2001. Written on the Body, Written on the Land: Violence and Environmental Struggles in Central India. Pp. 329-379 in *Violence Envts*

By noon Thu, Nov 3: A hardcopy of the following is due in my office and to be shared with a peer reader

An one page Prospectus of your Lit. Rev. Essays (Required)

An Outline and Annotated Bibliography of your Essays (Optional)

Week 11, Nov 9: Women, and the Gendered Global Economy

- ❖ Ward, Kathryn B., and Jean Larson Pyle. 1995. "Gender, Industrialization, Transnational Corporations, and Development: An Overview of Trends and Patterns." (Abridged version from the MG reader is in the CR)
- ❖ Fernández-Kelly and Diane Wolf. 2001. Dialogue on Globalization. *Signs; Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 26(4): 1243-1249
- ❖ Staudt, Kathleen, Shirin M. Rai and Jane L. Parpart. 2001. Protesting World Trade Rules: Can We Talk about Empowerment? *Signs; Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 26(4): 1252-1257
- ❖ Gill, Lesley. 2000. Power Lines and Global Connections (Chpts 7 and 8) in *Teetering on the Rim: Global Restructuring, Daily Life, and the Armed Retreat of the Bolivian State*. NY: Columbia University Press. (CR)
- ❖ Recommended:
 - ❖ Bachrach Ehlers, Tracy and Karen Main. 1998. Women and the False Promise of Microenterprise. *Gender and Society* 12(4):424-440.
<http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=08912432%28199808%2912%3A4%3C424%3AWATFPO%3E2.0.CO%3B2-1>
 - ❖ Video: Lorraine Gray's *The Global Assembly Line* (Goddard has copy)

Week 12, Nov 16: Women's Movements and Transnational activism

- ❖ <http://womencrossing.org/basu.html>
- ❖ Alvarez, Sonia. 1998. Latin American Feminisms "Go Global": Trends of the 1990s and Challenges for the New Millennium. Pp. 293-324 in *Cultures of Politics, Politics of Culture: Re-visioning Latin American Social Movements*. Alvarez, S. E., E. Dagnino, and A. Escobar. Westview Press. (CR)
- ❖ Part 5 included chpts from that section in WGD (Skim)
- ❖ Asher, K. "Ser y Tener": Engendering Development and Ethnicity in the Pacific Lowlands of Colombia." Under revision for resubmission to *Feminist Studies* (will be sent over email to class list)

THANKSGIVING BREAK – NO CLASS

Week 13, Nov 30: Institutionalizing or “Mainstreaming” women and gender concerns in development and politics: STUDENT RESEARCHED & LED session
I encourage you to work in groups. The idea of this section is to

- ❖ get a sense of how large development institutions such as the United Nations and its various arms, the World Bank and different bi- or multi-lateral aid agencies, and selected international NGOs have “institutionalized” gender concerns.
- ❖ Critically evaluate these efforts based on what we have learnt so far. For example, compare them with the kinds of gender analyses and theories we have discussed.
- ❖ All students hand in an individually written report on their research and presentation

By noon Mon, Dec 5:

Post an abstract (max 150 words) of your essay including its title and 4-6 keywords on Blackboard (Required).

Submit and exchange drafts of your Literature Review Essay (Optional)

Week 14, Dec 7: Presentation of Literature Review Essays

- ❖ EVERYONE reads the abstracts of all literature review essays and presents their work
- ❖ If you have exchange drafts, share typewritten comments (about 1 page) on the draft with your peer

Final Research Paper due Tuesday, Dec 13 by noon

Assignment 1: Reading Review (due by noon, Sept 6, 2005 in my office)

For your first assignment, write a 2-3 page review of *Colonialism: Familiar Territory*, the introductory chapter of Briggs' *Reproducing Empire*. Your review should summarize Brigg's main arguments and discuss how it contributes to your understanding of the debates around third world women, gender and development. The Kabeer, Tinker, etc readings listed under week 2 of the seminar can inform your understandings of the latter. Use the following questions to structure your review.

What is the main aim of Briggs' book on Puerto Rico?

What debates does she engage and why?

What discipline and approaches inform Briggs' research?

What are her main conclusions, or theoretical claims?

According to you what part of Briggs's aims, approaches and claims are most relevant to our seminar and why?

Weekly Annotations: For all sessions after Sept 7

1. Every week, write a **BRIEF ANNOTATION** (max 500 words) of that week's readings and topic to stimulate seminar discussions. Post your annotation on the appropriate thread on Blackboard by noon on Tuesdays. For more on annotations see <http://www.utoronto.ca/writing/annotatebib.html>
2. Begin by listing full citations for all readings using the ayp (author-year-page style) <http://www.fas.harvard.edu/~expos/sources/>. Please single-space your references, but double space between them.
3. In a sentence or two summarize the arguments or debates of the week's readings succinctly and clearly. Next critically discuss a specific theme in another 2 or 3 sentences. This is NOT the place for to include an exhaustive summary of all the arguments.
4. Add one "weighty" question for class discussion.

Literature Review Essay

The final paper for the semester is a 10-15 page review essay in which you locate, describe and evaluate the debates or issues related to a particular theme or subfield of

women, gender, and development. This essay may be a necessary springboard for your final Master's Paper or Undergraduate thesis. Or it could simply be an important learning exercise of the class.

- ❖ First identify what issues or dilemmas related to women, gender and development interest you or make you curious. Begin your research by drawing on seminar readings.
- ❖ Then go to the library to locate additional scholarly writings on the topic that interests you. Don't expect the preliminary digging to lead you to a specific or relevant research topic. Take the time to sift through the material you find. You'll have to search again and again and again. That's why it is called re-search!
- ❖ Distinguish between primary (raw or unprocessed data including such things as government or NGO policy or projects documents) and secondary sources ("processed" or published works in scholarly books and journals). Use the former sparingly if at all. For help on how do research and evaluate sources see <http://www.lib.duke.edu/libguide/home.htm> and <http://www.clarku.edu/offices/library/>
- ❖ Now return to your primary task, which is to locate the DEBATES about the topic that interests you. The assignment for the ID209: Beyond Victims and Guardian Angels seminar is not about finding solutions to pervasive problems of women's subordination nor to design gender policy. It is to do the background work for such and other kinds of papers. That is, I do not want you to write papers about projects related to women AND x, y, z (health, conflict resolutions, debt, remittances or microcredit or whatever). Rather, I want you to think about the kind of broader feminist issues and conceptual frameworks within which these projects and discussions about them are located.
- ❖ Remember that your task for this assignment is to describe, review and critically evaluate these debates as they apply to your topic of interest. Your literature review essay should be based on a minimum of five but more like 6-8 representative secondary scholarly sources including 2-3 references from the seminar readings and 1-2 monographs (i.e. single authored books not edited volumes). I want you to enter into conversations with feminist scholars, and advocates and critics of mainstream approaches to women, gender, and development.
- ❖ If you are still confused about what a literature review entails, ask a librarian or refer to these links <http://www.utoronto.ca/writing/.html>
<http://ecdev.hku.hk/acadgrammar/litrev/section1/part1.htm>
http://faculty.plattsburgh.edu/gary.kroll/courses/his319/guidelines_on_review_essays.htm

For **further instructions** on how to read and write for this class, details and deadlines of the above assignments, and my grading criteria see the document **ID209writing.doc** posted on **Blackboard**